Thirty-Seventh Annual

BYZANTINE STUDIES

CONFERENCE

DePaul University

Chicago, Illinois

October 20-23, 2011

ABSTRACTS of PAPERS

This Book of Abstracts was compiled and edited by James Hull, Elena Boeck, and Brian Boeck from papers supplied electronically by the speakers. Copyright © is reserved by the individual speakers.

Cover Image: Heraclius, with Heraclius Constantine. 610-641. AV Solidus (20mm, 4.50 g, 6h). Constantinople mint, 10th officina. Struck 629-632.

Credit for image is due to http://www.cngcoins.com.

Index of Sessions

Session IA: Relics, Amulets, Pateras in Late Antiquity

Chair: Ann Marie Yasin (University of Southern California)

Empress Aelia Pulcheria and Relics

Irina Tamarkina (University of Wisconsin-Madison)

The empress Pulcheria, daughter of the emperor Arcadius and sister of Theodosius II, is considered one of the most powerful empresses in Byzantine history, actively influencing her brother's politics. Pulcheria appears to have been extremely active in discovering relics of Christian saints and sponsoring their transfers to Constantinople. Thus, sources credited her with the transfer of the relics of St. Stephen in 420s, the discovery of the relics of Forty Martyrs of Sebaste in 434-446 and construction of the church of St. Laurence to accommodate relics of St. Stephen, St. Laurence and the prophet Isaiah in early 450s.

Traditionally, Pulcheria's involvement with relics is treated as her way to reinforce the secular power that she enjoyed as she ruled as regent for her brother Theodosius and was confirmed in her status as Augusta. This became especially crucial after Theodosius' marriage, when his wife Eudocia received the title of Augusta herself and gained influence over Theodosius. Therefore, Pulcheria's discovery of relics of Forty Martyrs, coinciding with Eudocia's delivery of relics of St. Stephen from Jerusalem, is interpreted as Pulcheria's counter-attack on Eudocia's rising influence at the court.

I argue that the discovery of the relics of Forty Martyrs was orchestrated not to reinforce Pulcheria's image in the competition with Eudocia but to restore her religious reputation that came under attack in the pro-Nestorian circles. This event gave Pulcheria the possibility to show herself as deserving divine revelations but also to demonstrate her humility and conformity with the religious gender models that, according to Nestorian circles, she trespassed.

Collection of relics in the Church of St. Laurence allowed Pulcheria to reinforce her and Marcianus' legitimacy and might have been used in suppressing the Monophysite controversy. Later Byzantine sources credit Pulcheria with the construction of the church of St. Laurence that housed the relics that arrived in Constantinople under Theodosius II. After the death of Theodosius, Pulcheria conspicuously finished the construction so that this collection of relics would be associated with her and Marcianus's name. It would allow her to present herself as legitimate heir of the Theodosian dynasty at the time when the Western Emperor did not recognize her husband, Marcianus, as a legitimate emperor. The cult of relics of St. Stephen was promoted by Monophysite circles around Eudocia which resided at that time in Jerusalem. By

connecting the relics of St. Stephen brought to Constantinople by Eudocia earlier with the church associated with her name, Pulcheria might have aimed at showing that the Chalcedonians have control over these powerful relics and thus quelling the Monophysite dissent.

The study of Pulcheria's involvement with relics demonstrates how efficiently she used them in establishing her position among political and religious elites. It also sheds light on the complexity and flexibility of the cult of relics which allowed individuals of varying backgrounds to negotiate their power and authority.

Magic in the Social Sphere: The Amuletic Image in Early Byzantium

Matthew S. Isner (Pennsylvania State University)

Early Christians in the eastern Mediterranean inherited a rich tradition of Graeco-Egyptian amuletic imagery which they selectively appropriated in order to protect themselves from a variety of illnesses and meddling demons. On a series of silver and bronze armbands from Syria/Palestine, which probably date from the mid-sixth to the mid-seventh century, apotropaic motifs such as the Chnoubis and the Holy Rider appear alongside Gospel scenes derived from *locus sanctus* iconography. These armbands, which have been discussed by Gary Vikan, were almost certainly designed, at least in part, to protect female wearers from uterine disorders through a variety of techniques including sympathetic magic and the invocation of Jesus' name. Aside from the interplay of image and supernatural healing which plays out on these objects, however, the social dimension of amuletic imagery in early Byzantine communities demands deeper examination.

For reasons which can be excused and understood, most recent scholarship which discusses amuletic imagery in early Byzantium endeavors primarily to identify iconography and determine the spiritual function of the amulets. This treatment is often parenthetical at best. Further contextualization of this visual material within early Byzantine society suggests that people decorated amulets with images not only to enhance their apotropaic potency, but to display their religious identity in the arena of social politics and reputation building, where certain social groups were inherently more susceptible to suspicion and infamy than others. An analysis of the imagery found on these armbands in conjunction with a consideration of the sociological

oppression faced by various groups in early Byzantine communities, such as actresses and the infirm, reveals that portable art associated with supernatural healing served to guard the bearer from disease itself and to affirm one's spiritual allegiances in the public realm.

The Parabiago Patera: Evidence in Review

Julia Carr-Trebelhorn (University of Kentucky)

The Parabiago Patera, as it has been known since Alda Levi made its discovery known to a broad public in 1935, has often been used as supporting evidence for theories of a late fourth-century revival of pagan religion together with classical culture. At least since H. Bloch, in his 1945 contribution to Momigliano's collection, *The Conflict Between Paganism and Christianity in the Fourth Century,* Late Antique Roman silver has been viewed as a source of evidence for a pagan revival that coincided with one of classical style and iconography. Luisa Trenta Musso and Ruth Leader-Newby have shown Levi's original Antonine dating to be incorrect, and have correctly identified it as a plate rather than a patera. Levi's treatment of the dish as a document of Roman religion persists in the still common use of the name she gave it. Together with the new, Late Antique dating, the classical style still seems to support the identification of the iconography of Cybele with a late fourth-century pagan aristocratic renaissance.

Recently, in *Silver and Society in Late Antiquity*, Ruth Leader-Newby has used the category of *paideia* to loosen the historiographical strands that conflate classical style with pagan practice, including the Parabiago Plate. Nevertheless, her work continues to link Classical style and iconography with "religious lore" for finds without Christian context, while classical religious material becomes secular in Christian finds:

> (t)he Parabiago, Corbridge, and Ballana plates are all examples of *paideia* as knowledge of pagan religious lore; by contrast the Mildenhall plates show how paideia could contribute to the secularization of the imagery and myths of traditional pagan deities like Dionysus (159).

Kathleen Shelton did much to establish this secular use of classical iconography in Christian art, but the implications of her argument have not been fully assimilated in the scholarship of non-

4

Christian subjects. The given meaning of silver objects often shifts based on the context of their find. The burials receive treatment as religious objects, while hoards are frequently seen as household or family collections hidden for protection, creating a dichotomy between otherwise similar objects.

   The major archaeological evidence concerning the find has been lost, resulting in a treatment of the dish in isolation from the styles, subject matter, and workshops of other known silver treasures. Musso has reminded us that it was not buried alone: found in Milan, it was described by Levi as a burial, with an urn. Also included was a less-spectacular silver spoon that only rarely appears in the discussions. By looking at other fourth and fifth century burials that have included finds of precious domestic objects and comparing them to other domestic luxury goods, this paper defines a more grounded understanding of the Parabiago Dish.

Session IB: Middle Byzantine History

Chair: Brian Boeck (DePaul University)

Epistolography Between Byzantium and Bulgaria: Imperial Ideology in the Letter Collection of Leo Choirosphaktes

AnnaLinden Weller (Rutgers University)

This paper explores how the imagined landscape of Byzantine imperialism and imperial ideology responds to the actual state of imperial control on the ground by comparing the ideological image of Byzantium dominant in the political rhetoric of the 10th-12th centuries to the practical experience of that empire present in both the writings of imperial officials and in the local histories of the imperialized territories on its edges. It moves from elucidating Byzantine imperial ideology to exploring its practical function. In doing so, the paper asks the following question: *how is the image of the empire preserved outside the empire?*

To explore the distance between the perceived and the imagined authoritative worlds of ideology, this paper turns to the question of the self-identity and narrative coherence of the Byzantine imperial agent. Toward what ends do these agents produce texts? The presence of imperial agents outside the empire is part of the projection of empire and therefore a promotion of the state. The individual agents, however, possess a multivalent relationship with the projection of empire, which, while it relies on the overarching ideology of the empire, also encompasses their own particular experiences. Therefore, examining the representation of Byzantine imperialism through the epistolary texts produced by its agents is necessarily a process of asking not only what the story of Byzantine imperial power is, but who is telling it.

Specifically, this paper compares two epistolary collections which share an addressee, namely Symeon of Bulgaria (r.893-927 CE): on the one hand, the diplomatic correspondence of Symeon and the Patriarch Nicholas Mystikos (852-925 CE), on the other, the correspondence of the *magistros* Leon Choirosphaktes (~845-910 CE).This latter letter collection, found in MS 178, folio 268-282 at the Monastery of John the Evangelist at Patmos, forms the center of the paper. Choirosphaktes' collected epistolography includes letters to Symeon, internal (Byzantine-to-Byzantine) correspondence dating from Choirosphaktes' embassy to Baghdad, and exile letters written to the Emperor Leo VI during the period in which Choirosphaktes was forcibly tonsured and confined to the monastery at Studios. I argue that this particular collection was aimed at an audience of Choirosphaktes' Constantinopolitan peers, and that it is therefore possible to discern the differences in his attitudes and presentation of Byzantine ideology when he is describing his embassy to the Bulgars as opposed to when he was writing to or from polities considered more

"civilized" in the Byzantine schematic, such as the Caliphate in Baghdad. The image of the Bulgar *archon* which appears within these letters is one created specifically for that Constantinopolitan audience. Despite being "on the ground," Choirosphaktes presents an image of the Bulgarian ruler which is rhetorically and ideologically oriented toward the metropole. In comparison, the extant correspondence between Nicholas Mystikos and the same Symeon, despite being essentially Constantinopolitan (i.e. centralized, universalizing, perhaps even Commonwealthian) demonstrates a degree of actual diplomatic practice.

Basil's Thunderbolt: Niketas Ooryphas and the Portage of the Corinthian Isthmus

David K. Pettegrew (Messiah College)

In AD 872, Niketas Ooryphas, the *droungarios* of the Roman navy, allegedly portaged a fleet of *dromons* over the 7km Isthmus of Corinth and delivered a surprise attack on a fleet of Arab pirates and Christian rebels in the western gulf. The episode is first recorded in the *Vita Basilii* and reappears in slightly modified versions in the later chronicles of John Skylitzes, George Kedrenos, John Zonaras, and Makarios Melissenos. In scholarship on the interaction of Byzantium, Islam, and the West in the ninth and tenth century, the story has either been passed over or accepted at face value without comment. And yet, the account is remarkable for it narrates the transfer of an entire fleet of twenty ton galleys over the Isthmus in a single night, and constitutes the first recorded episode of portaging warships since Octavian's transfer after the Battle of Actium 900 years earlier.

In this paper, I consider the meanings of the episode of 872 in light of recent research on the significance of portaging, the historical and literary meanings of transferring fleets over the Isthmus, and the archaeology of the Corinthian portage road known as the *diolkos*. While there is no reason to believe that Niketas actually moved a fleet over the Isthmus, the *Vita Basilii* does employ portaging in a manner consistent with historical accounts by Thucydides, Polybius, Livy, and Cassius Dio. In those ancient accounts, transferring ships overland represents military stratagem that functions to narrate dramatic, rapid offensive or defensive action while simultaneously highlighting the brilliance and heroic character of the general or admiral accomplishing it. In the case of 872, the portage is significant for narrating Niketas Ooryphas' dramatic victories over Arab pirates and drawing attention to the competence and restorative

reign of Basil I. The writer(s) responsible for the story, the intellectual circle of Constantine VII, show their awareness of the role of stratagems in narrating military engagements. Moreover, the continuing importance of this story, often retold and sometimes expanded through the sixteenth century, highlights the heroic memory of Niketas, Basil's thunderbolt, in one of the earliest Byzantine victories over Arab pirates.

An Attempt at a Byzantine Hungary: The Lost Birthright of Boris Kolomanovich

Christian Raffensperger (Wittenberg University)

Ever since the ninth-century arrival of the Magyars in the Pannonian Plain, the Byzantine Empire attempted to influence or control their internal succession and external politics. There are multiple examples of this, from Byzantine-backed Magyar raids on the Bulgars, to Géza's marriage to a Byzantine princess in the eleventh century, or the near inheritance of the Byzantine throne by a Hungarian, Béla III, in the late twelfth century. The example discussed here is comparatively little known, but stretches across the breadth of Europe and brings multiple European royal houses into competition for the throne of Hungary.

In 1112, near the end of his life, Koloman of Hungary (d. 1114) married for a second time. His bride was a young woman named Evfimiia, daughter of Vladimir "Monomakh," ruler of Rus′. Over the course of the next year and a half, Evfimiia was repudiated for reputedly having an affair, bore a son who was named Boris (and was referred to in many sources as the "son of Koloman"), and Koloman died. Thus began Boris' life and his lifelong attempt to claim his birthright, the throne of Hungary, and his attempts to find anyone willing to back that claim.

Boris' struggle took him throughout Europe, and brought him into the royal courts of Rus′, Hungary, Poland, the German Empire, France, and Byzantium. The rulers, or various political players in each of those places, took an interest in Boris pursuant to their own political ambitions, either internal or external. In 1146, Boris traveled across Hungary itself in the retinue of Louis VII of France on his way to Byzantium, and eventually to an abortive crusade. It was in Byzantium that Boris stayed for most of the rest of his life, becoming a pawn of the Byzantines in their attempts to control the Hungarian throne, and finally marrying and becoming part of the administrative apparatus of the empire.

This paper examines not only Boris' complicated struggle to attain the Hungarian throne, but the political dynamics between medieval European states as multiple rulers attempted to use Boris, and his claims, for their own purposes. Particular focus is devoted to Byzantium's multivariable attempts to manage Hungary, and attempts to arrange the Hungarian succession in their favor. Boris' relationships with the Komneni did not result in his ascension to the Hungarian throne, but in a long term settlement of Boris and his children in Byzantium, and as participants in internal Byzantine politics. Why he failed in his goals and why he stayed in Byzantium are questions worthy of further investigation.

Session IIA: Church Decoration

Chair: Karen Scott (DePaul University)

Envisioning the Apocalypse in the Church of San Vitale

Andrew Griebeler (University of California, Berkeley)

The mosaics in the chancel and apse of San Vitale in Ravenna provide a rare opportunity to examine how the decorative program of a sixth-century church might have functioned as a whole. Their preservation opens up two areas of inquiry: First, how are individual panels integrated into a program and, second, how might that decorative program have influenced reception of the liturgy? Much work has already been done in both areas. Though previous studies have succeeded in characterizing the general themes present in the program, such as Eucharistic sacrifice or Trinitarian dogma, they have generally ignored how these separate threads are interwoven. The prominent apocalyptic aspect of the scenes that appear in the vault, apse and on the east wall, though long recognized, has also generally been passed over in previous research. Moreover, despite early scholarly interest in the relationship between the mosaics and the liturgy, researchers have tended to neglect the significance of that relationship and its relevance to reception.

This paper seeks to develop upon previous scholarship by attempting to understand how the mosaics worked together and influenced reception of the liturgy. It delineates basic correlations between the apocalyptic aspects of the mosaics and particular stages in the liturgy. In doing so, it advances a functionalist reading of the mosaics insofar as they elaborate upon social relations that are articulated during the services. The mosaics would have reiterated these social relations during the Liturgy of the Word, that is, the part of the liturgy most concerned with instruction and spiritual edification. Later on, with the celebration of the Eucharist, the mosaic program marks the moment at which the believer's experience of the decorative program is most intense. With the approach of each congregant to receive the sacrament, decorated surfaces previously obscured by walls and other people become visible. Visual relations and analogies within the mosaic program and those between the decorations and the rites of the church are also clarified and replicated. At the same time, the simultaneous presentation of these scenes tends to collapse the complicated analogical relations between them. This moment tends to actualize liturgical time as being beyond both the past and future, in the eternal present. The so-far neglected apocalyptic scenes play an essential role in completing this vision. The congregants stand not just before a depiction of Christ, but they rather emerge as the Church of the elect assembled before the eyes of God. By assessing the connections between its thematic content, audience and liturgical setting, it is clear that the mosaic program allows the faithful to better sense God's

presence. Comprehensive analysis suggests that temporal simultaneity may even evoke the divine experience of time and space, which, by allowing the congregants to be or even to see more like God, provides them with a platform for receiving heavenly grace.

ΜΕΓΑΣ ΦΟΒΟΣ: The Roll of Reverential Fear in a *Majestas Domini* Composition

Anna M. Sitz (University of Pennsylvania)

The rock-cut Pancarlık Kilise near the Ürgüp valley in Cappadocia impresses viewers today with its fairly well-preserved *Majestas Domini* apse painting. Dating from the middle Byzantine period, the apse composition is a part of a larger tradition of *Majestas Domini* paintings from other churches in Cappadocia and beyond. The Pancarlık apse is unique, however, in its inclusion of a painted inscription. This inscription, I argue, in concert with the surrounding images, guides the viewer response. It explores the significance of the surrounding *Majestas Domini* image while directing attention to the role of "φόβος" in the apse.

Scholars such as Jerphanion (*Les Églises Rupestres de Cappadoce*, 1936) and Jolivet-Lévy (*Les Églises Byzantines de Cappadoce*, 1991) have interpreted the painting along traditional art historical lines, focusing on the textual sources, iconography, and setting. The composition is a combination of motifs from several Biblical sources (Ezekiel, Isaiah, and Revelation). Each text vividly describes a vision in which the narrator encounters God enthroned in heaven and surrounded by strange creatures, such as many-eyed seraphim. The conventional art historical approach also notes the apse painting's participation in visual traditions, such as the four beasts holding books. Jolivet-Lévy explores how the visual compilation of textual sources is appropriate for an apse: the unity of Old and New Testaments; the future coming of Christ; the Eucharistic overtones of purification.

The unique painted inscription in the apse, however, directs our attention towards a different avenue of investigation. Inserted into the circular frame surrounding Christ enthroned, the paint is damaged near the middle part of the inscription, presenting difficulties in reconstruction. The letters surviving with moderate clarity read: "ΜΥΚΡΟΣΟΤΥΠΟΣΜΕΓΑ-ΟΦΟ------- ΝΤ-ΝΤΥΠΟΝΤΗΜΑΤΟΝΤΟΠΟΝ." Jerphanion, Pallas ("Une Note Sur le Decoration de la Chapelle de Hagios Basileios de Sinasos"), and Jolivet-Lévy each propose reconstructions for

the missing letters. Jerphanion's reconstruction has been the most influential. He posits "μικρός ὁ τύπος· μέγας ὁ φορ[ῶν ἀπέρα]ντον τύπον. Τίμα τόν τύπον," on the assumption that the last word, written "τὸπον," is a misspelling for "τύπον." Jerphanion's reconstruction thus suggests that the inscription is a response to iconoclasm. The assumption of a spelling error, however, is not justified, nor is the association with iconoclasm. Jolivet-Lévy provides the best reading, as I argue based on the visible remains of the painted inscription and the sense of the Greek. Her reconstruction is: "μυκρός ὁ τύπος· μέγα[ς] ὁ φό[βος· ὁρῶ]ν τὸν τύπον, τήμα τόν τὸπον".

The words "μέγας ὁ φόβος" ("great fear"), I argue, are key in our understanding of the apse painting as a whole. Both the visual imagery and the setting of the painting are active agents in the creation of a sense of reverential fear. In this paper, I examine the Pancarlık Kilise apse as a whole in order to explore the role of reverential fear in Byzantine spirituality.

Theodore Metochites, Saint Michael the Archangel, and the Fate of a Soul: Reconsidering Art and Eschatology in the Chora Parekklesion

Christopher W. Platts (Yale University)

Several decades ago Paul Underwood and Sirarpie Der Nersessian observed Theodore Metochites's extraordinary interest in Saint Michael the Archangel in both text and image. In Metochites's unpublished *Address to the Archistrategos and the Angelic Essences*, the author praised Saint Michael for his numerous beneficent apparitions to humankind and beseeched the Archangel to intercede on his behalf at the Last Judgment. For Underwood and Der Nersessian, this literary composition helped explain the unusual prominence of Michael in several frescoes in the Chora parekklesion, including *An Angel Slaying the Assyrians* on the south wall of the entrance space, *An Angel Escorting a Soul* in the northwest pendentive of the east bay, and the oversized roundel of the Archangel on the soffit of the bema arch.

Recent scholarship on the Chora parekklesion has focused on representations of and allusions to the Virgin in the dome of the west bay and in the cycles of biblical prefigurations and saintly hymnographers below it. However, a reconsideration of the narrative episodes and figures in close proximity to Metochites's supposed tomb niche reveals several significant iconographic

peculiarities that underscore Saint Michael's importance to the *ktetor*, in essence affirming and advancing the ideas of Underwood and Der Nersessian. In particular, analysis of the Jacob scenes, *An Angel Slaying the Assyrians*, and the unusual ordering of the angels in the dome provides further evidence that Metochites wished for Michael to play a key eschatological role as his protector and intercessor not only at the end of time but also immediately after death. In addition, these iconographic peculiarities corroborate the idea that Metochites was actively involved in planning the painted decoration of his funerary chapel and monastery, a proposal that several scholars have advanced based on allusions to Metochites's life recognized in other frescoes at the Chora.

Hagia Sophia in Trebizond: New Approaches to its Sculptural Program

Sarah T. Brooks (James Madison University)

This paper re-examines the form and meaning of select sculptural elements decorating the south porch of the Church of Hagia Sophia in Trebizond on the Black Sea, a building founded most likely by Manuel I Komnenos, Emperor of Trebizond, during his reign 1238-1263. Hagia Sophia's remarkable architecture, surviving frescoes and relief carving have prompted past authors, including Antony Eastmond and before him, D.T. Rice et. al., to provide important insight into the church's architectural and decorative programs. In doing so, they have considerably enriched our understanding of the building's connections with both local Islamic and neighboring eastern Christian cultures.

What has been overlooked to date in the framing of the south porch's Genesis frieze are select Western European or Gothic forms incorporated within the larger sculptural program, namely the elegant quatrefoil window, the foliate hood molding, the triple arch, and the west capital supporting the porch, all elements which complement and highlight the rich array of Byzantine, Islamic, and eastern Christian motifs in relief here and elsewhere on the building. These Gothic forms on the south porch speak to the imperial patron's broader interest and awareness of artistic traditions in Western Europe, and especially in the lands of the Crusader Kingdoms to the south of Trebizond. Manuel I's diplomatic relations with Western Europe, including his negotiations with the French monarchy to secure a western princess as his bride, provide the possible contexts for the adoption and adaptation of these elements in the Byzantine imperial foundation. Their

fuller appreciation adds considerably to our understanding of the rich artistic and cultural world of the emperor of Trebizond and his court.

Session IIB: Palaiologan Culture

Chair: Elizabeth Fisher (The George Washington University)

Elements of Pythagorean Mathematics in the Letters of Nikephoros Gregoras

Divna Manolova (Central European University)

In 1938 Ştefan Bezdechi published his revised transcription and translation of Nikephoros Gregoras' (ca. 1292/1295 – 1358/1361) Letter 6, a piece of Palaiologan writing Bezdechi characterized as "un échantillon d' *arithmetica geometrica*." No further research followed Bezdechi's publication of the text and Letter 6 remained as unknown to the scholarship as its unnamed addressee. With respect to its general subject, Gregoras' letter discusses a topic omnipresent in Byzantine epistolography, namely the identical nature of author and addressee, the two being a single soul in two bodies. The subject, however, was approached through a rather unusual rhetorical strategy. That is, the first ten lines, or one third of the letter, (which in the current standard edition of Gregoras' letter collection by P. A. M. Leone (1982) extends to thirty two printed lines) present a brief account of Pythagorean mathematics and this was precisely what drew Bezdechi's, as well as my attention to the text.

The present paper argues that the source of Gregoras' mathematical summary was Plutarch's *On the Generation of Soul in the Timaeus*, a commentary on *Timaeus* 35a1–36b5. As Inmaculada Pérez Martín has demonstrated, in the Chora monastery Gregoras had access to two codices (*Laur*. 70, 5 and *Par. gr.* 1672) containing the treatise, both of which Gregoras read as indicated by his marginal notes. This argument is further supported by a comparative analysis of the corresponding excerpts from Letter 6 and from Plutarch's commentary.

Ultimately, the present inquiry draws conclusions as to what Gregoras' strategy of appropriating and modifying Plutarch's account was, how such a choice of rhetorical framework was motivated and what the intended impact of such a letter was with respect to its addressee. In his treatment of Letter 6 Bezdechi has suggested that Gregoras addressed it either to his mentor Theodore Metochites or to Demetrios Kabasilas who were both Gregoras' frequent correspondents as demonstrated by various letters addressed to either of them and included in Gregoras' epistolary collection. The present paper reassesses Bezdechi's interpretation in view of its analysis of the mathematical account in beginning of the letter and the possible rhetorical function(s) such scientific inclusion was intended to serve. It is relevant to the present analysis to discuss also Gregoras' overall interest in scientific subjects, such as Pythagorean mathematics or natural philosophy. Thus, the present paper discusses the mathematical account in the beginning

of Letter 6 also in the context of Gregoras' *Solutiones quaestionum*, a minor scientific and philosophical treatise addressed to Helena Palaiologina.

Reconsidering Renaissance Greek Grammar through the Case of Chrysoloras' *Erotemata*

Erika Nuti (University of Turin, Italy)

Manuel Chrysoloras' *Erotemata,* the grammar on which the first humanists used to learn Greek, has been transmitted by more than a hundred manuscripts and many printed editions made between the fifteenth and the sixteenth century and containing different versions. Their variety has hitherto represented an obstacle for a critical edition and its absence has restrained scholars from studying time and origin of this grammar and its contents. My paper reconsiders Chrysoloras' grammar in the light of the extant documentation and proposes a new direction in the research on this text as well as the other humanistic Greek grammars.

Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Palatinus gr. 116 contains Aristophanes' *Plutus, Clouds and Frogs* (fols. 25-141), preceded by an introduction (fols.23-24) and by a text of *Erotemata* (fols.1-22) that, according to Agostino Pertusi (1963), is the earliest extant copy of Chrysoloras' grammar and the most authoritative one. A *subscripto* on fol. 141v**.** informs us that his pupil Guarino of Verona bought this manuscript in Constantinople in 1406. Pertusi's opinion has been generally accepted. However, a paleographical analysis has demonstrated that fols. 1-22 and 23-24 were added to the manuscript sometime *after* Guarino purchased it and other manuscripts containing *Erotemata* had been produced. Therefore, any hypothesis on the origin and development of Chrysoloras' grammar based on Pertusi's theory should be reconsidered.

The fact that the present status of our documentation prevents us from reaching any conclusion about the original version of Chrysoloras' grammar justifies a change in the methodology of research on, and approach to, this text. After examining many extant copies of this grammar and considering the textual transmission of other Renaissance Greek grammars, I have reached the following conclusions. First, several versions of *Erotemata* were circulating at the same time. Second, every version was related to a specific cultural environment. Third, and most importantly, it is possible to glimpse an evolution from a grammar that Chrysoloras wrote according to the Byzantine tradition to a shorter version elaborated by his pupil Guarino and,

finally, a more expanded grammar (e.g., the one printed in 1496 in Florence by Lorenzo de Alopa), which incorporated authentic Byzantine material into the framework of Chrysoloras' grammar, in order to suit the needs of Western students of Greek in the late Quattrocento.

The history of many Greek grammars in the Renaissance, the elements emerging from anonymous grammatical works collected in manuscripts of that period, and the most recent studies on *Erotemata* and students' texts confirm this picture. It is to be hoped that future studies on Renaissance Greek grammar will focus on single copies rather than abstract original texts and take into account the contribution of each of them to the investigation of the most important issues related to the revival of Greek studies in the West.

The Throne Room of the Palace at Mistra, 1429-1433

Diana Gilliland Wright (Seattle)

A variety of historians and publications concerning the archaeological site of Mistra give a broad date for the Palaiologan throne-room wing of 1400-1460. There is a remarkable absence of mention of this construction in the many documents of the period from Mistra. Regard for the actual history of the Despotate in the fifteenth century locates the construction of the throne-room wing to the years of 1429-1433. A study of long-available documents, taken in consideration with familial connections, provides strong evidence for the throne-room wing as a joint production of the Lords of Pesaro, Urbino, and Manuta, with Venetian financing.

The design of the throne room with a bench that runs around all four walls, a setting with no apparent contemporary comparanda, may be intended to evoke the *boule* of the Greek city-state and so suggests the participation of Georgios Gemistos Plethon in its design.

Breaking the Habit: Intrusions of Secular Dress on the Byzantine Monastic Habit

Jennifer Ball (The Graduate Center, CUNY)

The literary trope of monks and nuns wearing tattered rags, soiled clothing, and hair shirts found in so many saints' lives was largely an ideal not put into practice by monks and nuns of the medieval Byzantine world (eighth-fifteenth centuries). Rather the monastic habit participated in the larger Byzantine system of dress that governed secular clothing as well. Indeed, at times the very clothes used in the secular world found their way into the dress of Byzantine monastics.

This paper explores the intersections between secular dress and the monastic habit, which is here defined as the entire wardrobe of the monk or nun including both ceremonial dress for church and work clothes, both of which identified the wearer as monastic. The intrusions of secular dress into the habit can be observed both in literal terms, where monastics went to the same commercial markets for clothing as the general population, as well as on an unconscious level, where insignia and the other trappings of wealth, rank, locale and the like were borrowed from the secular world by monastics. For example the use of the color black, which came to signify power and wealth in the Late Byzantine period, increased in use for both monastics and secular citizens in the later centuries of the Empire. Other examples of influence can be found in local styles, such as the use of caftans among elite Kastorians as well as Kastorian monks. The use of certain forms for secular headgear also affected the ever-changing headgear of Byzantine monastics, for example in the *skepe*, the headdress of nuns, which takes on the squarish structure of Western style headgear for lay women in the last centuries of the Empire.

This research highlights the heightened interest in making clear the hierarchy within monasteries, both in terms of actual rank and also in terms of perceived social class that arises at the beginning in the Middle Byzantine period. This research also points to the increased awareness of a group or a corporate identity within each monastic establishment, of which dress was an outward marker. An institutional identity was formed in part by the regular reading of the *typikon* to reinforce the founding, history, and rules of the establishment among its members. The medieval Byzantine habit, it is argued, joins the system of secular dress to underscore the notion of belonging to the monastics themselves and also to convey their group identity to the society at large. For example, aristocratic and imperial monasteries with a large number of noble members wore habits that expressed their social class by using Byzantine cues in dress, such as ornament, color, and headgear.

Session IIIA: Panel in Honor of Walter Kaegi (I)

Chair: David Olster (University of Kentucky)

New Perspectives on Byzantine History in Light of Walter Kaegi's Work

John Haldon (Princeton University)

New Perspectives on Islamic History in Light of Walter Kaegi's Work

Fred Donner (University of Chicago)

Redating the Arab Conquest of Mesopotamia: the Implications for Byzantium

Parvaneh Pourshariati (The Ohio State University)

While editing Tabarī's volume on the years 12 and 13 of *hijra*, or 633-635 CE, that deals with the conquest of Iraq and Syria, including the important Battle of Yarmuk (which, incidentally, Tabarī places in the *hijra* year corresponding to 634/5), Blankenship observed that the space that Tabari devotes to the conquest of Iraq is double that devoted to the conquest of Syria. As it stands, moreover, the chronology of the conquests of Mesopotamia and Syria remains problematic. Using a variety of sources, in a recent study we proposed that the initial conquest of Iraq took place in the period between 628-632 CE, immediately after the "greatest war of antiquity" between the Byzantines and the Sasanians. The initial conquest of Iraq, we proposed, did not begin, as Tabari and Sayf b. Umar would have us believe, in the year 632 CE, *after* the death of the Prophet Muhammad and *after* the *ridda* wars at the death of the Prophet in 632 CE. If this revised chronological schema is valid, the conquest of Syria would have taken place *after* the conquest of Iraq. What implications would this new chronological schema have for our understanding of the Arab conquest of Near and Middle East? Was the Arabs' gaze fixated on Iraq and territories beyond, or was the prize of their endeavors Syria and Jerusalem? In short, were the Arabs more pre-occupied with the conquest of Iraq than of Syria? If so, what would be the implications of this new view of the Arab conquest of the Near East? It is left to historians in the school of Walter Kaegi, who adopt a comparative and global perspective, to tackle this potential new approach.

Session IIIB: Byzantine and Western Art

Chair: Jeffrey Anderson (The George Washington University)

The Byzantine Tradition and Italian *Maniera Greca* Painting:
The Case of the Orvieto Servite Madonna

Jaroslav Folda (University of North Carolina)

The Virgin and Child Enthroned with Angels commissioned for the Servite church in Orvieto around 1265-1270 is closely related to the Madonna del Bordone of Coppo di Marcovaldo in Siena, dated 1261, and the Virgin and Child by the Master of San Bernardino, also in Siena, dated 1262. But however close the paintings are in some features, they are all three by different painters who demonstrate the impact of various aspects of the Byzantine tradition that inspired them. Rebecca Corrie has, of course, discussed the imagery of the Bare-Legged Christ Child in two of these three paintings in the context of links between Siena and the Near East (1996). All are able to distinguish between the artists of these three major works and a second set of panels with the Virgin and the Christ Child by closely related Sienese painters identified as Guido da Siena and the Madonna del Voto Master, among others; both of whom worked in the 1270s and the 1280s. Their links to the Byzantine tradition are also strong, as Anne Derbes discussed in a 1989 article, but they may show the impact of Pisan's *Maniera Greca* painting as well.

Most of these large panel paintings with the Virgin and Child done between the 1260s and the 1280s in or near Siena feature an image of the Virgin with a western veil instead of a Byzantine *maphorion*. Only the Orvieto Virgin was originally given a beautiful floral crown. But all of these major Italian panel paintings done prior to Duccio's Ruccelai Madonna (1285) display one characteristic only rarely found in Byzantine art: the image of the Virgin radiant in her holiness, resplendent in garments glowing with chrysographic striations. With this in mind it is apparent that the characteristics of the chrysography employed by Guido da Siena and the Madonna del Voto Master in the 1270s and 1280s are clearly different from what we find employed by the earlier painters. And while we see that the chrysography of the Virgin on the Orvieto panel seems to reflect some aspects of the golden highlighting found on the Virgins in both the 1261 and 1262 panels, certain other characteristics of the chrysography appear independently and seem to indicate sources in the East not otherwise yet identified in these early developments. Certain few Byzantine images of the Virgin with chrysography are, of course, known in the Byzantine East in the thirteenth century, but they do not appear to be the sources for the Orvieto Madonna. No Byzantine icon of the Virgin and Child is known to have existed in Tuscany at this time with chrysography on the Virgin's garments. What other sources can we identify and

what light might the chrysography found on the Orvieto panel shed on the Byzantine stimulus to the *Maniera Greca* developments in Siena and Orvieto c. 1270?

From the Cradle to Beyond the Grave: the Iconography of Baptism at the Sepulchral Church of Archbishop Danilo II

Ljubomir Milanović (Rutgers University)

The church complex of the monastery at Peć originated with the construction of a Byzantine structure of unknown date, whose western half was largely incorporated into the church of the Holy Apostles, possibly begun by Sava (1175-1235), the first Serbian Archbishop. The building program at Peć achieved its final form with the projects undertaken by the archbishop Danilo II (1324-1337). He began with the church of the Virgin Hodegetria (circa 1330) that would house his tomb. His sarcophagus was placed in the northwestern corner of the church below the vault of a small, elongated space.

A shared narthex was added to the three monastery churches included in the Peć complex in the early 1340s. The western façade of the church of Hodegetria displays a monumental image of the Mother of God above the entrance that leads from the narthex to the interior. The Virgin echoes the *Blachernitissa* type with her arms raised in an intercessory gesture; however, instead of a hovering medallion of Christ on her chest, the Child is represented in a cruciform vessel of which the lower curve coincides with that of the Virgin's cloak. Christ blesses the viewer with both hands and the Mother and Child are flanked by representations of Danilo II and Saint Nicholas.

The iconography of the Virgin in Peć has been compared to that of the Virgin as the *Fountain of Life* as well as with the icon of the Mother of God *Zoodochos Pege* from the homonymous monastery in Constantinople. Such imagery was not, however, associated with the sacrament of baptism and its role in salvation and resurrection. This paper argues that the association with baptism, which was performed in the narthex of the church, links the image of the Virgin Mary with the tomb of Danilo II, reflecting his personal concern with the Last Judgment and salvation.

Unlike the *Blachernitissa*, where the medallion with Christ represents the womb of the Virgin in which the Word became Flesh, Hodegetria exhibits a new iconographic solution developed under Danilo II's patronage. Mary is here presented as a second or a new Eve and the water in her womb both sustains life and cleanses sin. Mary's womb, as the origin of the Incarnation, was considered the original site of baptism, and therefore an element of Christ's redemptive project. This relationship between baptism and Danilo II's tomb was underscored by the placement of a baptismal font, made of the same marble as his sarcophagus in the vicinity of the main church entrance. Read together, the font and the image of the Virgin above the door refer to the rebirth of the baptized, of spiritual regeneration in the present moment and holy perfection in eschatological time. Thus the font, mural, and sarcophagus form an associative chain that leads the viewer from outside to inside, from birth to death and rebirth, marking the path to redemption.

Venice, Byzantium, and the True Cross

Holger A. Klein (Columbia University)

From Late Antiquity through the Middle Ages and beyond, relics of Christ's Passion were collected and treasured by individuals and Christian communities in both the Byzantine Empire and Western Europe. Following the sack of Constantinople in 1204, some of the most venerated relics of Christ's Passion, namely his blood, fragments of the True Cross, the Crown of Thorns, and other objects looted from the churches, chapels, and palaces of Constantinople, reached the Venetian lagoon and were soon incorporated into the ritual life and liturgical practices of its foremost churches, monasteries, and confraternities.

While Venetian efforts to acquire new relics for its religious institutions slowed down considerably after the end of the thirteenth century, the city's role as a destination and center for the trade in high-profile relics and reliquaries from Byzantium can hardly be underestimated. Among the more distinguished relics of Christ's Passion that entered Venetian institutions during the fourteenth and fifteenth century was a relic of the True Cross given to the confraternity of San Giovanni Evangelista on December 23, 1369 by Philippe de Mézières (1327–1405), then Grand Chancellor of Cyprus, which started to work miracles almost immediately. Interestingly, it was only a hundred years later, namely between 1490 and 1506, that a written pamphlet was first

published to record these miracles and a monumental cycle of paintings commissioned by the confraternity to decorate the *Sala dell'Albergo* of the *Scuola Grande di San Giovanni* with crucial events that attested to the miracle-working power of the confraternity's precious relic. It may not be a mere coincidence that the written and painted records of this relic's miraculous activity in Venice were commissioned only a few years after the arrival of another precious relic of the True Cross in Venice, namely that given to the confraternity of *Santa Maria dei Battuti della Carità* by the Greek-born humanist and titular Latin Patriarch of Constantinople, Cardinal Bessarion, in 1472. The panel-shaped reliquary associated with Bessarion's donation is still preserved at the *Gallerie dell'Accademia* in Venice and has variously been attributed either to a fourteenth-century Byzantine or Italo-Byzantine workshop, or a Byzantine artist working in fifteenth-century Venice. What has also perplexed scholars is the date and origin of the silver-gilt and inscribed reliquary cross, mounted at the center of the reliquary's interior. Based on a recent examination and scientific analysis of the disassembled *stauroteca* in Venice, this paper sheds new light on the circumstances of the reliquary's history and manufacture as well as on artistic rivalry, the strategies of display, and the rhetoric of relics in fifteenth-century Venice.

Session IVA: Public Monuments in Constantinople

Chair: Cecily Hilsdale (McGill University)

Public clocks in late antique and early medieval Constantinople

Benjamin Anderson (Center for Advanced Study in the Visual Arts, National Gallery of Art)

Public clocks, both sundials and water-clocks, were found in at least five different sites in the monumental core of Constantinople in late antiquity and the early middle ages. In the absence of any archaeological remnants of these monuments, their study must rely on references in the textual record. As these references have never been systematically collected and analyzed, the clocks have become the subject of some confusion in the secondary literature. The primary task of this paper is thus to distinguish between the five different sites and provide hypotheses for the date and circumstances of the installation of each clock.

Ordered by date of installation, the five sites are as follows: First, a monumental clock was located between the Basilica and Augustaion, and is mentioned in three late antique sources. This was apparently moved in the sixth century to a second site, namely, the Chalke, where it remained at least through the seventh century, when it was described by a Chinese visitor, and probably through the eighth, if it is the same clock that was restored under Constantine V (741-775).

The third site is the northeastern corner of the Basilica, where a monumental clock was installed at the start of the reign of Justin II (565-578); this presumably survived into the ninth century, when its epigram was copied down. The fourth site is the garden of the Patriarchate, between the Hagia Sophia and the Augustaion; here a sun-dial seems to have been installed by the Patriarch Sergios (610-638).

The fifth site, finally, is the south-west corner of the Hagia Sophia. The water-clock at this location, mentioned in numerous medieval sources, has consistently been dated by contemporary scholars back to the sixth-century construction of the church. It is highly likely, however, that this clock was first installed in the ninth century, as part of an extensive campaign of construction in this area of the church.

The installation of several new clocks in the period between the sixth and ninth centuries is noteworthy in itself, as it attests to the active construction of public monuments during a period which is conventionally seen as one of stagnation in the urban image of Constantinople. It furthermore attests to the importance of the genre of the public clock, which has been almost entirely ignored in studies of the monuments of Constantinople. On the basis of the sources it is

possible to reconstruct the significance of these clocks in the administrative regulation and ceremonial life of the city. Furthermore their ceremonial use, considered together with selected cross-cultural comparisons, allows us to evaluate their significance in the public framing of imperial rule.

The Bronze Horseman as Symbol of Late Byzantine Constantinople

Elena N. Boeck (DePaul University)

Taking as a starting point an illustration of Constantinople in the Vatican Manasses Manuscript, this paper examines how the topography of power of the imperial capital was constructed for fourteenth-century observers. Hagia Sophia and a triumphal column with a monumental, bronze, imperial rider feature prominently in an image dedicated to the reign of the great imperial builder, the sixth-century emperor Justinian I (Vat. Slav. 2, fol. 109v). Since the imperial monument is not described in the text, the close spatial relationship between the Great Church and the triumphal monument takes on particular importance as an evocation of Constantinople. This paper does not revisit the various identities that have been attributed to the imperial horseman by medieval observers and modern scholars. Instead, it contextualizes the imperial rider in the fourteenth century and argues that the statue became a symbol of the imperial city for numerous observers. Owing to its ominous behavior and prominence in renovation efforts of the first quarter of the fourteenth century, it was described in detail by Nikephoros Gregoras and represented for Epiphanios the Wise.   The Vatican Manasses manuscript reflects this renewed fascination with the imperial rider in both Byzantium and the Slavic world.

Mighty Bronze and Worthless Currency: Herakles in Nicetas Choniates' *De Signis*

Paroma Chatterjee (University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill)

The coda to Nicetas Choniates' *Historia* with its enumeration of the fantastic sculptures that once littered Constantinople has long intrigued scholars. Titos Papamastorakis proposed that we read Choniates' ekphrases of the sculptures as political metaphors encompassing a series of contemporary events, not least the tragic dimensions of the Fourth Crusade. Anthony Kaldellis has further pointed out the ways in which the *Historia* consistently overturns the ideal of *taxis*; Choniates' very use of rhetorical and grammatical paradoxes in his text, Kaldellis argues, mirrors his perception of the topsy-turvy course of recent history.

Taking a cue from Papamastorakis and Kaldellis, this paper performs a close reading of one particular sculpture in Choniates' arsenal: the bronze Herakles. Choniates characterises Herakles as still, even melancholy, whereas his cloak of lion skin appears so palpable that it frightens onlookers with its (imagined) roar. The paper argues that the statue is implicitly positioned within the framework of post-Iconoclastic theories of the icon. By drawing upon the rich metaphor of the cloak, the virtues of stillness and animation are debated. Moreover, by remarking that this mighty statue was destroyed to make coin, Choniates draws the reader into another, parallel debate regarding the intellectual and material values of objects that re-enacts the salient issues of Iconoclasm.

In doing all of the above, this paper argues that Choniates posits an emphatically *Byzantine* visuality as the hallmark of human civilisation. By figuring the Latins as an excessively literal race without the subtlety to perform ekphrases that invert *tekhne* (art) and *phusis* (nature) - desirable paradoxes, as opposed to the undesirable political reversals described in the preceding chapters - Choniates points to the disruption of history that results therefrom. In contrast, Choniates frames Byzantine techniques of looking at and writing about works of art as the standard against which human civilisation is judged, and which enable historical continuity.

Session IVB: Classical Themes in Byzantine Literature

Chair: Margaret Mullett (Dumbarton Oaks)

"Animate Speech" in Byzantine Rhetorical Theory

Stratis Papaioannou (Brown University)

Premodern Greek literary aesthetics are often described as reader-oriented, focused on determining the effect and proper reception of discourse. Nevertheless, Byzantine rhetorical aesthetics placed great emphasis on authorship and the handling of authorial subjectivity. With respect to this, Byzantine rhetoricians expanded on Roman Greek rhetorical theory (Dionysius of Halicarnassus, Aphthonios, and, especially, Hermogenes), which they combined with the rich patristic and neoplatonic tradition of exegesis. This paper examines one of the seminal concepts by which Byzantine rhetors were encouraged to insert themselves into texts: "animate speech" (*empsychos logos*). This notion was introduced in Hermogenes' discussion of stylistic virtues, what he called the *forms* (*ideai*), and was adopted and expanded by rhetoricians like Ioannes of Sardeis (9th c.), Ioannes Sikeliotes (early-11th c.), and Michael Psellos (11th c.), among others. According to Hermogenes, "animate speech" could arise naturally in rhetoric, yet it could also be feigned by a skilled speaker. This was, therefore, a rhetorical method that could convey authority and truthfulness, but also raise suspicion about the intentions and sincerity of an author. Byzantine writers capitalized on the potential of this Hermogenian concept, allowing space for the creative appropriation of rhetorical techniques and effects, yet without compromising the moral integrity of the ideal Christian rhetor/author.

Λόγῳ σὺν οὐδενὶ: Photios, Choricius and the two faces of myth

Aglae Pizzone (University of Durham)

"He is a follower of the true religion and respects the rites and temples of the Christians, although I do not know how, carelessly and without any rationale, he gratuitously introduces Greek myths and pagan stories in his writings, sometimes even when addressing sacred subjects." (Photios cod. 160, 102b, 32-37). These lines devoted to the assessment of the literary production of Choricius of Gaza are usually adduced to prove Photios' inconsistent or even contradictory approach to pagan mythology.

As a matter of fact, elsewhere in the *Bibliotheca* Photios does not hesitate to praise the use of mythical paradigms and often takes advantage of pagan tales, resorting to lesser known and singular *exempla*. Nevertheless, a closer look at Photios' text on Choricius proves that the Patriarch's judgment is fully consistent both with the theoretical principles of his literary criticism and with his practice in quoting or using pagan paradigms. The key words in the above quoted passage are actually "carelessly and without any rationale" (ὀλιγώρως καὶ λόγῳ σὺν οὐδενὶ).

Unlike Dio Chrysostomos, for instance, praised by Photios under this respect, Choricius did not use mythological paradigms to serve educational or moral purposes. The criterion of usefulness, so dear to Photios, played a secondary role, if any role at all. Choricius' main concern was to engage and entertain his audience, rather than to educate and edify it. Such an attitude surfaces very clearly in the speeches he actually delivered in Gaza, for instance the wedding speech celebrating the marriage of his former pupil Zacharias (V [*Dial.* 4] Foerster).

In this good-humored piece of writing Choricius imparts a characteristic tang of irony to the mythical paradigms and Homeric quotations he resorts to, far beyond what was taught by rhetorical treatises. Instead of envisaging the epic pattern as a viable model or a dignified paradigm, Choricius mockingly underlines the chronological and cultural distance between the present and the past, between reality and literature. Epic poetry is seen as an entertainment for leisure hours, particularly suitable for the young given its flippancy and pure literariness. Moral education is therefore completely out of the picture. Choricius endorses a "ludic" attitude towards pagan imagery, one that could not but be discarded by Photios. By looking, for example, at the Patriarch's letter collection it appears quite clear that he always employs pagan *exempla* very much σὺν λόγῳ. In order to better understand the literary function of the mythical paradigms surfacing in the letters, one must read them against the actual historical background of the epistles. From this standpoint Photios' treatment of classical mythology appears fully coherent both in theory and in practice.

Medium, Authenticity, Class & Genre

Andrew Walker White (Stratford University)

In a recent presentation I advocated a re-reading of Byzantine culture that assumes they knew what they were doing when they called a particular kind of gathering "theatre" or a particular piece of writing "drama"; to justify this approach I owe a better explanation of the processes through which certain traditional literary and performance genres were manipulated, appropriated, dispersed and revived. This paper describes a matrix of unique relationships that gradually develop in Greek culture from the Hellenistic period onward, as a first step in creating a more complete historical narrative for theatre and dramatic literature through Roman – i.e., Byzantine – times.

Theatre historians tend to begin with definitions of genre that apply universally, not realizing that these definitions are contingent upon any number of different factors. For example: "drama" for us means a uniquely formatted page of un-musical text created with a live theatre performance in mind. We allow for closet drama of course, but we assume that it still has the same 'look' on the page and assumes the same theatrical aesthetic (it portrays an action enacted by characters, etc.). We do not examine the full implications of Aristotle's point in *Poetics*, that the recitation of a single written text can create a more *authentic* dramatic experience than a full theatrical production.

In studies of contemporary culture like Philip Auslander's *Liveness*, we have seen how the mediatization of live performance through audio and video recordings has made live performance almost irrelevant to the definition of genre. Authenticity of genre is now contingent on the recording media, and these media in turn substantially alter our perceptions and hence our definitions of genre. This reduction of live performance to mediatized performance, carefully applied, may help us to understand why certain Greek prose manuscripts were classified as "dramas" in their own time even though they had no theatrical referent.

The reduction and transformation of theatrical performance to the written page likewise raises the question of class divisions. Manuscript-dramas develop concurrently with the foundation of the Artists of Dionysus and the relegation of literate citizen-amateurs to private performances. The "old" analogue technology of the physical theatre proved better suited for hosting popular entertainments on domestic themes (adultery plays, etc.), which were easily transmitted through

oral tradition. Meanwhile, the manuscript suited the dramatic and theatrical interests of an amateur, educated elite. This bifurcation of Greek culture into literate-amateur and (possibly) illiterate-professional creates ample precedent for the later *Commedia Erudita-Commedia dell' Arte* divide that defined the culture of the Renaissance.

Session VA: Orthodox Seminarian Perspectives: Byzantine History for Contemporary Catholic-Orthodox Dialogue

Chair: Charles Barber (University of Notre Dame)

The Council of Lyon and the Byzantine Church's Reaction

Thomas Manuel (Holy Cross Greek Orthodox School of Theology)

In 1274 the Council of Lyon reunited the patriarchate of Constantinople with the pope in Rome, thus ending years of schism. A highly controversial decision in the Byzantine Church, it would cause years of strife and debate for those who were in support of union and those who were against the seemingly unfair decision of Lyon and wished to preserve the faith prior to the council. This debate culminated in 1285 with the Council of Blachernae, which went about erasing the union with Rome. More significantly the Council of Blachernae, headed by Patriarch Gregory II, would produce for the first time a theologically sound refutation of the troubled *Filioque* issue, that had been an issue between the two halves of the church ever since its adoption in the West centuries prior. Prior to this council, the issue of the *Filioque* had either been glossed over by the Byzantines, attempting to downplay the situation, or not treating it fully. Through Patriarch Gregory's *Tomus*, signed at the Council of Blachernae as the official document of the Byzantine Church, for the first time the Byzantines had a position that systematically refuted the *Filioque*. Not only did it expand upon St. Photios' *Mystagogy* from the ninth century, Gregory's *Tomus* also served as a spring board of further debates and attempts at union with Rome in the future. In my work I focus on the Byzantine reaction, as specified at the Council of Blachernae and Gregory's *Tomus,* and how this effected relations with the west in the future. I then illustrate how this and its historical memory affect contemporary Catholic-Orthodox dialogue.

Linguistic Differences in Theological Expression and Understanding: Synchronic and Diachronic Perspectives

Christos D. Strubakos (Holy Cross Greek Orthodox School of Theology)

The dialogue between the Christian East and West has been largely focused on differing dogmatic perspectives, especially with respect to the *Filioque*. Part of the controversy lies in basic linguistic differences between the Greek and Latin languages; differences which necessarily lead to different philosophical understandings. Christianity, as a religion born in the Greco-Roman world, became especially influenced by these linguistic differences as Churches became established in both Western and Eastern portions of the Empire. In particular, as Eastern and Western Fathers worked within the framework of their language to describe the basic tenets of their faith, mainly the Holy Trinity, the language they spoke directly influenced both the method by which they expressed their thought, and at a deeper level, their thought itself. This paper examines how semantic and syntactical differences in Greek and Latin would have led to different expressions, and subsequently, to different perceptions of the Trinitarian doctrine. In order to do so, select Fathers from both East and West are examined and analyzed in order to show how their language shaped their understanding of the Holy Trinity. I then argue that these subtle differences in perception finally coalesced in the *Filioque*. The paper concludes by arguing that the acknowledgment of linguistic differences is central to further Catholic-Orthodox dialogue, both for clarification of the *Filioque* issue, and for appreciating the development of different thought patterns in the East and West which have been conditioned by the languages spoken.

Late Byzantium's Palamite Controversy: Framework for Modern Orthodox-Catholic Dialogue

D. Vasilis Schairer (Holy Cross Greek Orthodox School of Theology)

Much progress has been made in recent years with regard to Orthodox-Catholic dialogue. The late Pope John Paul II affirmed his commitment to the restoration of the Church breathing with "both lungs," indicating that the schism between East and West halved each tradition. Many others assert that the division rests in linguistic differences that led to misunderstanding or to political division that caused enmity between cultures. This paper asserts, however, that the division runs to the core of theology in two different approaches to doing theology. It examines the late fourteenth century's controversy between Barlaam, taken to represent the Western mindset and approach, and Gregory Palamas, illustrating the Eastern Church's approach, in order to show that two modes of theology were and are still currently at play. The paper demonstrates through Barlaam and his defense that the West depends upon *credo ut intelligam* that emphasizes rationalism in theology. The resultant theology of the West has rejected mystical experiences of God as the basis of theological exploration as well as the division between essence and energies. The East, on the other hand, exemplified by Palamas, rests on hesychastic theology. This approach underlines the inability for the human mind to grasp God, pushes for rejection of logical analysis of theological questions, and emphasizes experiential revelation of God in his uncreated energies as the basis of theology. The debate that resulted in Byzantium consequently illustrates the inability of these two approaches to accept one another, stalling attempts to restore the two churches in Byzantine times, but also today. In exploring the two figures, the paper connects history to contemporary dialogue to show that serious attempts must be made to reconcile these two approaches before the resultant political, administrative, or historical traditions can be reconciled. It raises preliminary questions in order to further this endeavor.

Session VB: Panel in Honor of Walter Kaegi (II)

Chair: Ralph Mathisen (University of Illinois – Urbana-Champaign)

PSI I 76 verso and the Structure of Labor on the Large Estates of Byzantine Egypt

Todd M. Hickey (University of California, Berkeley)

The recent historiography of the late antique economy has relied heavily on the corpus of Egyptian papyri. This scholarship, best represented by important monographs from Sarris (*Economy and society in the age of Justinian,* Cambridge 2006) and Banaji (*Agrarian change in Late Antiquity,* Oxford 2001), has emphasized the contribution of wage labor to economic production, especially on the "rationally" managed large estates that dominated the Egyptian countryside. Such estates, it is indicated, were organized around settlements called *epoikia* ("hamlets"), which were designed to house the directly exploited workforce and served to isolate resident laborers from social circuits falling outside of the estate's ambit.

Aspects of this new reading of the evidence are problematic. For example, while it seems uncontroversial that *epoikia* were the building blocks of Egyptian estates, that they furnished shelter (including barracks) for labor, and that they were structured to limit the horizons (and thus increase the dependency) of their inhabitants, the deployment of these resident labor forces on estate lands is less clear. Though there are "whiffs and glimpses" of wage labor, there are also strong indications of tenancy; indeed, tenancy was the interpretation favored by earlier scholars like Hardy (*Large estates of Byzantine Egypt,* New York 1931). It may well be that arguments about labor have been framed in too much of an either-or fashion, and of course certain forms of tenancy (e.g., sharecropping) can be the effective equivalent of wage labor.

Contributing to the problem is the relative lack of evidence for the internal functioning of the *epoikia*. Typically our understanding of these settlements is derived from documents that concern larger units of estate geography (e.g., the *prostasia,* which comprised five or so hamlets); few late papyri furnish a "worm's eye" view of the *epoikion* and its structures. A precious exception is provided by *PSI* I 76 a and b, a pair of unpublished accounts, each measuring over one meter long and currently among the papyrological holdings of the Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana. These texts likely concern the property of one Flavia Christodote (fl. 570s), the daughter of the deceased *patricius* Ioannes—that is, someone from substantial means, and for this reason, her accounts are certainly germane for the issue of labor deployment on the large estates. When we read these papyri, we uncover an agrarian regime that stands in marked contrast to the one depicted in the recent literature: fixed-rent tenancy is by far the dominant mode of labor exploitation. More striking, however—and hitherto unelaborated (if even noticed)

in the scholarship—is the fundamental communality of these lease arrangements; in some respects, one is reminded of modern Italian *affittanze collettive.* The present communication explores the form of land tenure prevailing in the *PSI* accounts and highlights other characteristics of "*epoikion* life" that are illuminated by these documents.

Sale of a Moorish Slave Girl, AD 629(?)

James G. Keenan (Loyola University Chicago)

In the history of papyrology it sometimes happens that even important documents after publication still manage to fly below the scholarly radar. One especially exotic example is the Strasbourg contract for the sale of a slave, with associated receipt for the purchase price, edited by F. Preisigke in 1906 ("Ein Sklavenkauf des 6. Jahrhunderts (P.gr.Str.Inv. Nr. 1404)," *Archiv für Papyrusforschung* 3: 415-424). The special interest in this piece rests in the slave herself, a twelve-year-old girl of Moorish extraction, and in her importation to Hermopolis in Middle Egypt after her primary acquisition, apparently in Nubia, from unnamed "Ethiopian slavedealers." For some reason this document escaped capture in Preisigke's own *Sammelbuch* (volume I [1915])—that is, until *SB* volume XVIII published in 1993. It was subject in 1981 to an important reassignment from the editor's proposed sixth century to a dating in the seventh (R. S. Bagnall and K. A. Worp, "Christian Invocations in the Papyri," *Chronique d'Égypte* 56 [1981] 112-133 at 125 n. 1). Its exact year, based on an indictional year date in the text, is likely to have been either 629 (the preferred though queried date in the Heidelberger Gesamtverzeichnis) or 644; that is, of course, from the very end of Byzantine, or even Persian rule in Egypt, or the very beginning of the Islamic period.

To date, the main contribution to appreciative assessment of the Strasbourg papyrus has been R. H. Pierce's 1995 reprinting of the Greek text with the addition of an English translation ("A Sale of an Alodian Slave Girl," *Symbolae Osloenses* 70: 148-166). Pierce's valuable introduction naturally focuses on the Nubian background to the kind of slave trading implied in the document, whereas Preisigke's early notes had concentrated on parallels to the sale's rich but yet to be fully explored legal terminology. Both therefore provide somewhat one-dimensional evaluations of the document's full scope and importance. Missed in this are its narrative possibilities and its associations with other sales of enslaved children (of Ptolemaic to late Roman date) brought into

Egypt from outside. The present paper considers all the above: Nubian environment, legal terminology, embedded narrative, and the fit of this piece into papyrological documentation as a whole, including that on the history of slavery, as the land passed from Byzantine to Arab rule.

Translating Jerusalem in Late Antiquity:
Cyrus, Alexander, and Patterns of Imperial Patronage of Sectarian Sanctuaries

Hagith Sivan (University of Kansas)

Few stations along Alexander the Great's meandering journeys through the Near East have fired a fiercer scholarly controversy as his Jerusalem excursion. To be precise, whether or not Alexander visited the city where he graciously lent his support to the Jewish Temple and its priesthood (not neglecting to withdraw sponsorship from the rival Samaritan sanctuary atop Mount Gerizim), is a question that has generated a monumental debate, and substantial bibliography. Instead, I wish to explore how royal patronage, real or invented, of sectarian sanctuaries in Late Antiquity reshaped power dynamics between space and memory, between subject and sovereign, and between a dominant religious center and a periphery of worshippers.

In this presentation I propose a brief reexamination of several transformative episodes in the history of Jerusalem's Temple Mount in Late Antiquity. These include the initiative of the emperor Julian in 362 of rebuilding the Jewish Temple within the double context of a universal religious revival (of paganism) and of a Persian campaign; the Persian (Sasanid) patronage of a Jewish attempt to rebuild the Temple in 614 in the context of the short-lived Persian conquest of Palestine; the emperor Heraclius' restoration of the Cross to Jerusalem and his plan to recast Temple Mount as a Christian sanctuary; and the construction of the Dome of the Rock by Abd al Malik (completed in 692), sealing the mutation of the same monumental space. Throughout, the most intriguing aspect of these attempts was the fact that Temple Mount presented a speculative emptiness, a space no longer graced with a temple but rather haunted by memories of its enduring past.

I analyze two ways of demythologizing such displacements, one harking back to an Achaemenid royal charter (of Cyrus the Great c. 530 BCE), the other linked with stories canonizing the presence of Alexander in Jerusalem. The relationship between these two types of

recognition and authorization is less one of competitiveness than of coexistence. In the context of the ideological struggles that characterized late ancient Palestine, between Jews and Samaritans, Samaritans and Roman authorities, Christians and pagans, Christians and Jews, Jews and pagans, and between Christian and Jewish "orthodoxy" and sectarianism, imperial figures behaving either as a Cyrus or as an Alexander created a discourse that bridged the rupture between the distant past and their contemporary political function. The ways in which such relationships were rehearsed and reinterpreted shaped the active interface between myth and monumental space.

Session VIA: Late Antique Literature

Chair: Claudia Rapp (University of Vienna)

Villainous Visage: The Rhetoric of Physiognomy in Julian's *Misopogon*

Carly Maris (Tri-Campus Graduate Program in Classics, University of California)

As an invective sparked by public mockery of his scruffy beard, Julian's *Misopogon* is aptly named. In the work we learn that the inhabitants of Antioch ridiculed his hairiness, equating his looks with those of a goat. In response to this mockery of his visage, Julian portrays the inhabitants of Antioch in a villainous light. However, the work is often criticized. Gregory of Nazianzus cast Julian and his literary works in a most ornery light. Henry Hart Milman (1887), editor of Edward Gibbon's *Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire,* wrote that the *Misopogon* "exhibits [Julian] as borrowing the worst part of the Christian monkish character, the disregard of the decencies and civilities of life." More recently, Bowersock (1978) emphasizes the work's literary worthlessness, painting the *Misopogon* as nothing more than maniacal rants of a troubled emperor.

Recently, several scholars, such as Susanna Elm (2003), have endeavored to show that negative perceptions of Julian often are based on a Nazianzan bias. Maude Gleason (1986) restocks the work's literary merit and deems the *Misopogon* an "imperial chastisement" disguised as satirical panegyric. As Gleason has shown, the work lives up to the designation through ironic praise of immoral behavior. Gleason's argument for literary merit is heightened when considering the *Historia Ecclesiastica* by the thirteenth-century historian Nicephorus Callistus Xanthopoulos, who describes the *Misopogon* as "noble and very elegant" (*Historia ecclesiastica* 27.31-32). This Byzantine praise forces us to accept that Gregory of Nazianzus' critique of the emperor did not completely overshadow later reception of his work during the Christian empire.

With the merit restored, certain sophisticated literary devices within the invective stand out. One such device that has been gaining interest in scholarship on rhetoric is physiognomy, the study of external features as indicative of internal character. Physiognomy has been in existence since the time of Aristotle, was reemphasized by Galen, advanced by the sophist Polemo, and reiterated by Julian's personal physician Oribasius. Two recent works on Polemo and physiognomical rhetoric are particularly insightful: one, a study of the semiotics of gender by Maud Gleason; the other, a compilation and translation of Polemo from Greek and Arabic sources by G. R. Boys-Stones and Simon Swain. In these works we learn not only physiognomical traits, but also how these traits are used rhetorically.

I intend to apply physiognomical theory to *Misopogon,* focusing on the use of the "leonine" man. How does Julian rhetorically utilize the "leonine" man to villanize the Antiochenses, and how do later Byzantine scholars respond to this rhetoric? To what degree does his invective adhere to or stray from the physiognomical traditions we find in ancient treatises? What is the face of the villain, if not the bearded visage of Julian the Apostate?

The Funerary Oration on John Chrysostom (BHG 871, CPG 6517) and New Evidence for Leprosy in Byzantium

George Bevan (Queen's University)

The funerary oration on John Chrysostom, discovered by the Bollandist Florent van Ommeslaeghe and provisionally edited in his 1974 dissertation, only received a full edition and translation in 2007 by M. Wallraff and C. Ricci. T.D. Barnes had earlier mined the text for historical data (*Studia Patristica* 37, 328-345) and reached important conclusions about the text and authorship. First, the author cannot be Martyrius, as some manuscripts suggest, and is most likely a certain Cosmas, identified as the author of a funerary oration for Chrysostom in a medieval catalogue. Second, this Cosmas was almost certainly a deacon (or perhaps a lector) under Chrysostom. Third, the oration was delivered shortly after the death of Chrysostom in exile but likely no more than a year later, circa 408 CE.

While the funerary oration offers few genuinely new historical details about John's fall and bolsters only a handful of claims in other sources hitherto regarded as suspect, its very existence and the perspective it represents are of particular historical importance. Nowhere is this more true than in the story of John's building of a leprosarium outside of Constantinople. Cosmas is unique among all sources on John's fall in claiming that wealthy landowners who had properties along the river on which the hospital was to be built complained bitterly about the contamination of the waters by the lepers' cleaning of their bandages. So strident were their objections that the leprosarium was never completed and, so Cosmas claims, engendered further hatred against John by the wealthy. Palladius refers only in general terms to John's building of hospitals, but says nothing about the objections to his leprosarium.

The funerary oration also provides important information, more generally, on popular attitudes towards leprosy in Byzantium. Greek and Roman medical authors state that leprosy is caused by a humoral imbalance that sends excessive amounts of black bile into the blood. As such, the disease is non-communicable. Both Gregory of Nyssa and Gregory of Nazianzen attest to a growing problem with leprosy in Asia Minor and emphasize that the disease cannot be spread between persons. The historian Timothy Miller has even suggested that Byzantium bequeathed to the Middle Ages a more humane view of leprosy than that found in Mosaic Law. Cosmas offers strong evidence that this was not the case. Not only did the ignorant, decried by the Gregories, believe that leprosy could be spread, but the elite also supposed that the disease was like a "reptile" that could crawl from affected individuals to infect the healthy with this "living death".

'*Mea Dictione*': Rufinus, Origen, and the Authorial Autonomy of Jordanes

Brian Swain (The Ohio State University)

Cassiodorus' *Gothic History* has ever been considered a far better, more intriguing, and more significant text than Jordanes' own history of the Goths, despite the fact that the former no longer exists and probably has not been read for well over a millennium. Serving as an official in the Ostrogothic court in Italy, Cassiodorus' lost history was commissioned by Theodoric the Great himself, and was completed by 533. It has long been assumed that Cassiodorus' history would have been uniquely informed by authentic Gothic oral traditions and, had it survived, might have been held in higher regard than even Tacitus' *Germania* by scholars of Germanic antiquity. Many, however, have argued that it does survive, if in an abased form, in the version of Jordanes' Gothic history known as the *Getica*. Jordanes, a far humbler creature, and probably of Gothic descent himself, wrote from Constantinople in 551. In the *Getica*'s preface, Jordanes states that he has been commissioned to abridge Cassiodorus' history. This statement combined with some hints of Cassiodoran language in the text have been enough to convince most scholars in past 150 years that we indeed possess an epitome of Cassiodorus' *Gothic History*.

The matter, though, might not be so simple. Jordanes also states in the preface that he no longer had access to Cassiodorus' text as he wrote, that he added portions of his own authorship, and that he drew on numerous other Greek and Latin authors. Given this, recent scholarship has

struggled to reckon the extent to which Jordanes utilized Cassiodorus, and the degree to which the *Getica* preserves its main source's themes and objectives. And while there is a slowly growing body of specialist research which has argued for various levels of Jordanes' authorial autonomy, the field still considers him largely derivative.

.

This paper aims to push Jordanes' rehabilitation further. Indeed it builds upon my research presented at the 2009 Byzantine Studies Conference which sought to reconcile the *Getica*'s themes and objectives to the context of the contemporary Gothic war in Italy through analysis of Jordanes' allusions to Virgil. Here, Jordanes' work is further contextualized and the problem of his indebtedness to Cassiodorus is more fully addressed. It is argued that Jordanes' announcement of his divergence from Cassiodorus is found in a long-known, but surprisingly understudied element of the *Getica*'s preface. That is, that the preface is itself a close re-rendering of the preface to Rufinus' Latin translation of Origen's commentary on Paul's letter to the Romans. Origen and Origenism was no small issue when Jordanes was writing in 551. Only eight years earlier in 543, Justinian had published an edict condemning Origenism. The condemnation was but one moment in the greater drama of the Three Chapters Controversy that enthralled both Christian theology and Roman politics in the mid- sixth century. Given such a context, Jordanes' use of Rufinus' preface to Origen's text becomes all the more interesting – indeed topical. Moreover, Rufinus' reputation for making substantial textual alterations in his translations of Origen bears directly on the question of Jordanes' relationship to Cassiodorus. Jordanes emerges as an author in full control of his work and, again through allusion, makes known his methods and themes.

Session VIB: Archaeology

Chair: Amy Papalexandrou (University of Texas – Austin)

Christian Monumental Architecture in the Sasanian Empire: the church of Qasr bint al-Qadi (Iraq) and the German Excavations of Ctesiphon, 1928/29.

Matthew P. Canepa (University of Minnesota - Twin Cities)

This paper analyzes the architecture of a large structure excavated during the 1928/29 German expedition to Seleukeia-Ctesiphon. In his earlier explorations of the region, Ernst Herzfeld had noted a mound (Qasr bint al-Qadi) on the western edge of Ctesiphon, but did not excavate the site. In the course of the German 1928/29 expedition, the German team's technical director, Friedrich Wachsmuth, excavated this site (Qasr bint al-Qadi) and uncovered a monumental rectangular structure with two phases that appears to have served as a church. Constructed of large baked bricks, the structure was characterized by engaged columns, a single, continuous vault that spanned its nave, and smaller, subsidiary vaults leading from its clerestory windows. The eastern section of the structure comprised three small chambers in parallel, corresponding to a *prothesis, bema,* and *pastophoria,* with small passages communicating between them and the nave. Wachsmuth, in his personal notes, as well as later scholars, drew parallels with two similarly designed structures uncovered at Hira (Iraq) and, intriguingly, coeval Persian palatial architecture of earlier Babylonian temples. This structure only received a brief mention in the equally brief German and English journal articles and pamphlet that published the results of the expedition, but the structure, integrated into such surveys as E. Krautheimer's *Early Christian and Byzantine Architecture,* has served as an important example of Sasanian Christian architecture. This paper evaluates these early twentieth century conclusions and the role the structure has played in later historiography in the context of Wachsmuth's unpublished notes and architectural drawings, recently acquired by my institution.

The Archaeology of Early Christianity – The Jordanian Contribution

Robert Schick (American Center of Oriental Research, Amman, Jordan)

The Christian presence in modern-day Jordan in the Byzantine and early Islamic periods has attracted scholarly attention since the beginnings of historical and archaeological research in the region in the late 19th-century. Close to 300 archaeological sites with early Christian remains have been identified in Jordan, and archaeological excavations have been carried out at about two-thirds of them since the 1930s. In recent years the field has seen increased interest, especially by Jordanians. Since the early 1990s over 80 early Christian churches have been excavated in Jordan (about four per year), making early Christianity the most intensively investigated topic of archaeological research in Jordan in recent years.

About half of the recent excavations have been carried out by Jordanians, on behalf of either the Department of Antiquities of Jordan or the various Jordanian universities. Their work has mostly been written up in Arabic and often found in obscure journals or in unknown MA theses by Jordanian graduate students, leading to the results remaining little known to Western scholars. This paper presents some of the more significant results of the projects by Jordanians, evaluates their methodological standards – rigor is often lacking – and examines the research questions that are, or are not, being addressed.

The day before at Amorium — on the eve of the Seljuk arrival: Excavating Middle Byzantine destruction layers from Basilica A

Nikos Tsivikis (University of Crete)

Seldom do archaeologists have the opportunity to locate, excavate, and record well-defined layers of the past; that is, stratigraphic contexts that can be connected to specific historical events. These sealed deposits act, in a way, like time capsules, extending beyond the limits of their site in the information that they offer.

The excavations at the Middle Byzantine thematic capital of Amorium in central Asia Minor have been lucky enough to locate one of the most important "destruction layers" under investigation in Byzantine archaeology, one connected with the destruction of the city in the summer of 838 by the Arabs led by the caliph al-Muʿtaṣim. Recent systematic work at the site has given us the opportunity to locate a second phase of the city's dramatic history. Almost two centuries after the Arab sack and after the city had again come to prosper it was abruptly abandoned in the wake of the coming of the new masters of Asia Minor, the Seljuk Turks.

Basilica A was an important Early and Middle Byzantine building in the center of Amorium and holds a focal position in its history. In this respect its building history mirrors all the major historical phases of the Byzantine city. As the excavation of the main church building has been concluded, our understanding of its construction has been greatly enhanced, and a thorough and systematic study is already under way. At the same time new trenches have expanded into the surrounding areas, uncovering a larger complex in which the basilica proper formed only the central element.

In the course of excavation an Early Byzantine ambulatory to the south of the main apse, originally a *skeyophylakion* or reliquary chapel was uncovered. It was transformed into a proper devotional chapel decorated with frescoes and liturgical furnishing around the year 1000, and a tower-like room was added to the west. This was only one of a number of major alterations that took place when the original aisled basilica was turned into a domed medieval church as a consequence of its total remodeling after the 838 destruction.

The unexpected find of a sealed context in the tower-like room adjacent to the southeast chapel contains a wealth of finds dated securely by coins to the 1060s. The finds included various materials—sculpture, pottery, coins, small finds, and fresco fragments that present us with the unique opportunity to understand the conditions of abandonment that marked the final days of Amorium as a Byzantine city. In this way we can expand on the older sweeping view of the fall of Byzantine Empire (e.g. Vryonis, Belke) and provide a far more nuanced discussion through the material remains of the Seljuk arrival and the Byzantine reaction to this conquest.

The Basilica on the Terrace at Golemo Gradište, Konjuh: Excavations 2009-2011

Carolyn S. Snively (Gettysburg College)

The basilica on the northern terrace at Golemo Gradište, Konjuh, R. Macedonia, came to light unexpectedly during the 2008 season of excavation carried out by the international project for archaeological investigation at Konjuh, sponsored by Gettysburg College and the National Museum of Macedonia in Skopje. Earlier researchers had mentioned the existence of a church on the terrace, but earth washed down from the acropolis in recent decades had completely concealed its walls.

Excavation during 2009 and 2010 revealed the presbyterium, part of the nave, and about half of the length of the south aisle, as well as the narthex and parts of three annex rooms to the south of the narthex. A massive terrace wall marks the south edge of the ecclesiastical complex. The nave and side aisles measure ca. 15m in total width. The length of the church from apse through narthex is 33m, but several walls continue beyond the west wall of the narthex and suggest the presence of an atrium or other compartment to the west.

Although there is evidence for multiple phases of construction, the last church may be dated to the sixth century and probably to the middle of the century. Its most unusual feature, *inter alia*, consists of two ambos, i.e., a small one within the presbyterium and a larger one at the south side of the nave. This rare occurrence has been documented in two churches at Philippi in the province of Macedonia. The fragmentary sculpture from the large ambo in the new basilica is similar in style and subject matter to the sculpture from the Rotunda. That church, located outside the south fortification wall of the anonymous Late Antique city at Golemo Gradište, has been known in the scholarly literature for more than fifty years (S. Radojčić, "Crkva u Konjuhu," *Zbornik Radova Vizantološkog Instituta* 1 [Beograd 1952] 148-167). The apsidal arrangement in the two churches is also similar, with an annular corridor within the apse.

The presence of two substantial churches with unusual features at the site of Golemo Gradište suggests that the city was in contact with other ecclesiastical centers in the 6th century. The size of the basilica on the terrace and its central location within a large complex allows us to argue that it was the seat of a bishop.

Session VIIA: Religious Culture in Egypt

Chair: Scott Bucking (DePaul University)

The *Ascension of Christ:*
A Newly Revealed Late Antique Painting in the Red Monastery Church

Elizabeth S. Bolman (Temple University)

In the fall of 2010, the eastern apse of the Late Antique triconch church at the Red Monastery (Sohag, Upper Egypt) was conserved. It revealed a substantial proportion of the earliest phase of figural painting in the Red Monastery church. Work of this period is not apparent anywhere else in the monument. The composition is an *Ascension of Christ*, and since the church dates to ca. 500 – 550, this example predates the well-known *Ascension* in the Rabbula Gospels of 586. It is contemporary with the Monza and Bobbio ampullae and the Sancta Sanctorum box, all dated approximately to the sixth century. The Red Monastery example is also the only surviving monumental Late Antique *Ascension*. The paintings of this subject from Bawit were all in small scale niches in private oratories or cells, although this fact is sometimes overlooked in studies of Christian apse painting. The study of the iconography in the Red Monastery also raises some interesting questions. For example: it is unusual in that it omits the Virgin Mary from the group watching the ascending Christ.

The first of four phases of painting in all three apses, based on the fragments that are visible are solid red. The second phase of painting therefore actually constitutes the first figural paintings in the church. When working in the east apse, the artists of the third phase gouged depressions in the surface of the *Ascension*, and applied a thick layer of plaster on top of this painting, as is common practice when repainting a wall. At some point shortly thereafter – still in Late Antiquity – the upper three-quarters of this layer of plaster fell off, taking with it much (although not all) of the final paint layer of the *Ascension*, but not removing the *sinopia*, or preparatory drawing. Another team of artists was subsequently engaged to repaint this apse and other parts of the sanctuary. Instead of using a thick plaster layer between phases, this group applied two or three thin coats of whitewash. In the eastern apse, most of this whitewash and its painted surface have flaked off over the centuries, revealing the *Ascension*. While the north and south semidomes show the fourth, and parts of the third phases of painting, the situation in the east semidome is completely unique.

The execution and style of this early painting differ markedly from the other Late Antique phases. The painting reveals several aspects of the artists' working practice that are typically hidden by the application of the final paint layer. This addition to the corpus of Late Antique

Egyptian art also problematizes traditional models of style, which see naturalistic renderings as belonging to the sphere of Alexandria, and stylized depictions coming from the Egyptian hinterland. The *Ascension* is astonishingly illusionistic, and its closest parallels are in Castelseprio (Milan) and Santa Maria Antiqua (Rome). The Red Monastery *Ascension* provides an opportunity to examine the relationship of the artistic production of Upper Egypt to that of the larger Mediterranean – a context within which it is rarely considered.

A Holy Rider from Bawit and the Ascetic Performance of Militant Piety

Agnieszka E. Szymańska (Temple University)

In her pioneering essay on the roles of the Early Byzantine monastic paintings from Egypt, Elizabeth S. Bolman has signaled the mimetic and apotropaic functions of the sixth- or seventh-century image of St. Sisinnios from the Monastery of Apa Apollo at Bawit. In my paper, I deploy the concept of militant piety, drawn from a recent book by Thomas Sizgorich, to offer the first comprehensive interpretation of this scene. By imitating St. Sisinnios, the monastic beholders joined the army of Christ, well-equipped to endure physical torments and triumph over demons. They thus partook in Early Byzantine discourses on religious violence, broadly defined as acts of aggression inflicted on the enemies of Christianity. A popular subject in the early monastic and hagiographic literature, the ascetic performance of militant piety crystallized the monastics' role in shaping and guarding the boundaries of the Christian community.

The wall painting of St. Sisinnios was located in chapel seventeen, one of the lavishly decorated rooms of the Monastery of Apa Apollo at Bawit, Egypt. Jean Clédat excavated the site at the beginning of the twentieth century. A small percentage of the murals have been preserved. Most paintings, however, including that of Sisinnios, vanished under windblown sand, following their basic documentation. With the recent resumption of excavation, the monastery continues to generate a rich corpus of evidence, which adds to our understanding of the visual culture of Early Christian asceticism.

The iconography of St. Sisinnios, not previously considered in detail, exemplifies a subject matter popular in the Early Byzantine period, that of a holy rider attacking a foe. A number of the fourth- to seventh-century amulets depict St. Sisinnios on the obverse piercing the demoness

Alabasdria, who was reputed to snatch newborn babies from their mothers and kill them. The amulets sometimes show the evil eye attacked by various animals on the reverse. The Bawit painting not only conflates the amulets' two sides, but also expands the common repertoire of motifs associated with this type of equestrian representation. In addition to two serpents, a scorpion, and other noxious animals confronting the evil eye, Sisinnios is surrounded by a centaur and a crocodile.

According to textual evidence, for example the fourth-century *Life of Antony*, demons lurked in the Egyptian desert in the guise of animals, pagan idols, or human beings. In the Egyptian milieu, serpents, scorpions, and crocodiles derived from the iconography of apotropaic stelae of "Horus-on-the-Crocodiles." Early Christian demonologies, such as that proposed by Origen (ca. 185-254), attribute the spiritual authority of monastics to their successful battles against demons. Patricia Cox Miller has explained the meaning of the centaur with regard to the fourth-century *Vita Sancti Pauli* by Jerome as a hybrid of passionate wildness and numinous knowledge. The presence of this ambivalent beast in the iconography of Sisinnios suggests, as I demonstrate, that the Bawit image participated in the ascetic performance of militant piety. In this case, the target is principally lust, which the half-nude Alabasdria epitomizes, and which features large in the writings of the desert fathers.

"Fantastic Images": Reading Hieroglyphs in Byzantine Egypt

Jennifer Westerfeld (University of Louisville)

The use of monumental hieroglyphs was restricted in late Roman Egypt as imperial support for temple construction and decoration waned, and literacy in hieroglyphs—never very high to begin with—diminished accordingly during that period. The latest known hieroglyphic inscription is a graffito from the temple of Isis at Philae dating to the year 394 CE, but as modern commentators have noted, this exceptionally late date is probably due to Philae's unusual longevity as a cult center and should not be taken as an indication that hieroglyphs were in active use elsewhere in the country at that time. However, the ubiquity of hieroglyphic inscriptions adorning Egypt's monumental spaces was such that hieroglyphs remained a common element in Egyptian visual culture well into the Byzantine period. The allegorical explanations of hieroglyphic signs proposed by pagan intellectuals like Horapollo are well known to modern

scholarship, but references to hieroglyphs in the literature of Christian Egypt have received relatively little scholarly attention to date. This is all the more surprising given that the extensive re-use of Pharaonic monuments by Christian communities would have brought the Copts into close contact with the written record of their pagan ancestors; indeed, Coptic monks were seen in later Arabic traditions as the last group to possess any degree of literacy in the ancient Egyptian script.

This paper seeks to redress this imbalance in the scholarship by examining the appearance of hieroglyphs as a motif in Coptic hagiographic and homiletic literature of the Byzantine period. Of particular interest are the different modes of "reading" hieroglyphs that these texts present, as well as the relationship between the representation of hieroglyphs and the representation of the pagan monuments on which the hieroglyphic inscriptions were carved. Coptic descriptions of hieroglyphs varied widely over time, and I argue that changes in the way Christian authors depicted these symbols participates in a broader transformation of Coptic discourse concerning traditional Egyptian cult-places. In the late fourth and early fifth centuries, when paganism was still to some degree a living presence in Egypt, the existence of pagan religious monuments and the hieroglyphs that decorated them might reasonably be seen as a threat—hence the confrontational rhetoric of authors like Shenoute, in whose works hieroglyphs are referred to as "laws for murdering men's souls," images to be feared and destroyed. By the eighth and ninth centuries, Christians were strongly in the majority and the same symbols could be viewed as "fantastic images," objects of wonder rather than fear.

A Spatial Turn in the Desertscape of Ancient Sketis

Darlene L. Brooks Hedstrom (Wittenberg University)

The dispositions of monastic life and rule require specific behaviors. When we consider the material remains of Byzantine monasticism in Egypt, we must rely almost exclusively upon the physical remains which are several generations removed from the well-known accounts of the first Desert Fathers of ancient Sketis, modern Wadi Natrun. It is the very nature of dwelling, as expressed by Martin Heidegger, which shapes the individual and the community to which an individual may belong, regardless of whether a structure is built. The monastic settlements in Sketis, from the late antique to medieval periods, evoke Heidegger's recognition of the importance of dwelling and belief. Just the mention of the famous Desert Fathers provides memories of behaviors and modes of living which may in fact not bear any connection with the built structures. Even now as the modern desertscape is being transformed by agricultural development, the view of the desert and the placement of monastic built environments are changing.

I consider Henri Lefebvre's production of social space and Tim Ingold and Matthew Johnson's phenomenology of landscape archaeology to interpret material remains of Egyptian monastic settlements. The theoretical treatment of religious geography within these theoretical models seeks to challenge the deterministic approach to monastic space by using Lefebvre's idea of the social space which is constructed by beliefs and actions within the space. Monastic structures then present a unique body of physical structures to assess the feasibility of interpreting space from the perspective of the constructed desert landscape with Byzantine structuring structures.

I use the monastic settlements from Sketis as a body of evidence for providing a micro-ecological history of monastic engagement within the desertscape or deserted landscape. A few questions I consider include: What cultural and social behaviors may have led to spatial configurations evident at Wadi Natrun? How did monastics read the desertscape and is there a shared vision of the dwellings within the desertscape? How did the locative order in turn create and reinforce monastic religious and social behaviors? The use of satellite imagery, excavated structures, and landscape archaeology provides the evidential support for considering a spatial turn in analyzing the mythology behind the ancient dwelling of the Desert Fathers.

Session VIIB: Modern Reception of Byzantium

Chair: Alex Papadopoulos (DePaul University)

Byzantium as a Historical "Missing Link": Shifting Modern Greek Perceptions of the Byzantine Empire in the Greek History Textbook, 1834-1913

Theodore G. Zervas (North Park University)

This paper considers several textbooks written by Modern Greek historians each of which focuses on Byzantine history. Each of the textbooks was used in Greek schools between 1834-1913 to connect a Modern Greek identity to the Byzantine Empire. This paper explores three main issues: how Byzantium is tied to a Modern Greek identity, which individuals, groups or historical events from Byzantium seem to be consistent in the Greek textbooks, and how the Byzantines are presented in the Greek history textbook. After the formation of the modern Greek state and the institution of a nationalized school system (1834) in Greece, Byzantine history served as a cultural bridge between ancient and modern Greece. History textbooks are among the most important mechanism in shaping a national identity and historical awareness. This was the case in Greece from 1834-1913. At first, Greek textbook writers struggled to find a place for Byzantine history within the broader framework of Greek history. Moreover, many textbook writers were divided on the cultural identity of the Byzantine Empire. In many of the textbooks the empire was referred to as Roman or Byzantine, while others described it as Greek and Hellenic. I found that by the late 19th century many of the Greek-authored textbooks on Byzantine history were in almost unanimous consensus that the Byzantine Empire was Greek. This was achieved by presenting it as a Greek empire that shared a common language, religion, and history with modern Greece. Nonetheless, Byzantine history typically gained the least amount of attention in most textbooks, but at times found itself almost the equal of modern Greek history. A program report from 1886 found that "Byzantine history in the Hellenic schools [upper elementary] occupied an inferior place in contrast to ancient and modern history" (Pantazidis, *Gymnasiaki Paidagogiki* Athens, In Greek, 1889, p. 263). While students at the elementary schools and gymnasium studied Byzantine history, the Hellenic schools offered instruction on the topic, instead emphasizing biographies of individual figures, such as Constantine the Great, Helena of Constantinople and the Emperor Justinian. However, in many ways Byzantium remained very important because it was seen as the missing link between the ancient Greek world and the Modern Greek world. Thus, while historians such as Constantine Paparrigopoulos did not go into great detail about Byzantine history, they did present it as part of the historical bridge that linked ancient and modern Greece. By 1880, the national point of view held that Byzantine civilization was purely Greek. Constantine Zachariadis's *History of Rome*

and Byzantium, which was authorized for use in Greek schools in 1884, describes Byzantium as "…conserving the light of the ancient Greek spirit" and "…preserving and transmitting ancient Greek civilization onto the world" (Constantinos Zachariadis, *Stichiodis Istoria Romaiki kai Byzantini* Athens, In Greek, 1884, 4-5). In addition to valorizing the Byzantine Empire, Zachariadis makes a clear distinction between the Latin speaking West and the Greek speaking East—to the point where the Latin "occident" is described by Zachariadis being at odds with the Greek "orient." When Zachariadis states, "Although the division of the two Churches may seem like a sad event, it was for the preservation of a Greek identity," he is suggesting that if the schism between the Roman Catholic Church and the Greek Orthodox Church had not occurred, Greek culture would have been overtaken by a Latin-based Catholic culture (Ibid., 35). Similarly, Zachariadis portrays the conquest of Constantinople by the Crusaders as a betrayal by the West: he describes how the Byzantines opened the gates of Constantinople to a Frankish army that was on its way to re-take Jerusalem for Christendom, only to have the Crusaders take the city and betray the Byzantine Emperor (Ibid., 63). Europe's hesitancy to help defend Constantinople in 1453 is also described by Zachariadis as a betrayal by the West (Ibid.). However, the most interesting part of Zachariadis's textbook is his chronological synthesis of ancient Greek Hellenism and Greek Christian Hellenism (*Hellenochristianismos*). According to Zachariadis, after ancient Greece, "…you have the intellectual and moral formation of medieval Hellenism" (Ibid., 66). Byzantium does not magically appear as a unique culture and civilization, but is instead built on the foundations of ancient Greek civilization. It is therefore in Byzantium that Christianity blends with ancient Hellenism and gives rise to the Modern Greek who carries on the legacy of his noble ancestors.

The Changing Image of Byzantium in Major Exhibitions

Sarah Teetor (University of Vienna)

The popular image of Byzantium has undergone significant change since the days of Edward Gibbon's *Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire* (1776-1788) or Victorien Sardou's *Théodora* (1884). Unlike many works of popular historical fiction, which often still capitalize on love affairs and conspiracies at an overly decadent imperial court, the curators and scholars responsible for major temporary exhibitions have in the last decades taken great steps toward presenting a more accurate and holistic image of Byzantine culture to the general public.

A survey of major exhibitions – defined as those having a great number of international loans, an international planning or guiding committee composed of recognized scholars, and the aim of encompassing the entirety of Byzantine art and culture – traces a shift in the representation of the Byzantine empire and its sphere of cultural influence. While major exhibitions up until the 1970s tended to concentrate on well-preserved luxury goods produced in the capital and largely held in Western European and American collections, major, if not "blockbuster", exhibitions of the past decades have broken out of this mold to incorporate a broader and more diversified body of objects to represent Byzantine artistic and cultural history. The inclusion of archaeological finds and rare objects from the still-living sphere of the Orthodox Church, many of which had not before been exhibited, thus more fully conveys our knowledge of Byzantine culture as revealed by contemporary scholarship. Nevertheless, a core of "must-see" objects defining the highlights of Byzantine art and craftsmanship continue to reflect the material wealth and dominant role of Christian belief in Byzantine society, for which the Byzantine Empire is commonly known.

Working primarily with exhibition catalogues and, where available, exhibition records and press reviews, this paper traces how – through the selection of objects chosen for display – the image of Byzantine culture presented in major exhibitions has changed and continues to develop.

Session VIIIA: Capturing Byzantium through the Lens: Photography and Byzantine Studies, Past and Present

Chair: Alex Papadopoulos (DePaul University)

Photographers, Archaeologists, and Tourists:
The Photography of Nicholas V. Artamonoff, 1935-1945

Günder Varinlioğlu (Dumbarton Oaks)

This paper studies the photography by Nicholas V. Artamonoff documenting archaeological vestiges in Istanbul and Western Asia Minor in 1935-1945. This exquisite collection of black and white photographs, acquired by Dumbarton Oaks in the early 1960s, still remains largely unknown, with the exception of a small number of photographs used in scholarly publications. The Artamonoff collection provides an architectural, urban, and archaeological survey of Istanbul and Western Asia Minor from the perspective of an amateur, yet avid photographer well connected to the archaeological community in Istanbul. The collection includes photographs presenting snapshots of Byzantine monuments of Istanbul, as well as of the discoveries made in recent excavations. Photographs from Pergamum, Priene, Ephesus, Hierapolis, and Laodicea were taken during the trips guided by prominent foreign archaeologists, among which appears Kurt Bittel, the director of the German Archaeological Institute in Istanbul. Artamonoff's photographic work belongs to a period of archaeological activity and increasing interest in the Byzantine cultural heritage of Istanbul. This is also the formative period of foreign institutes of archaeology, some of which were already active in Western Asia Minor since the last decades of the nineteenth century. The German Archaeological Institute opened a branch in Istanbul in 1929, the French Institute of Anatolian Studies was established in Istanbul in 1930, and the British Institute of Archaeology in Ankara in 1947.

Starting in the late 1920s, less than a decade after the foundation of the Republic of Turkey in 1923, the archaeological work on the Byzantine heritage of Istanbul gained a new momentum. The excavations at the hippodrome (1927-1928) by the British Academy; at The Great Palace (1935-1938) on behalf of the British Walker Trust; at St. Sophia (1935-1936), Odalar Camii (1935) and St. Euphemia (1942) by the German Archaeological Institute; and the conservation of the mosaics of H. Sophia (1931-1960) by the Byzantine Institute of America, mark the beginnings of archaeological investigations in Istanbul under the auspices of the new Turkish regime. Turkish archaeologists also carried out a number of projects in the 1930s and 1940s. The excavations at Balaban Ağa Mescidi (1930), Topkapı Palace (1937, 1944), Rhegion (1940-1948), and St. Irene (1946-1947) were carried out by Istanbul Archaeology Museums, Ayasofya Museum, Istanbul University, and the Turkish Historical Society.

This paper studies the Nicholas V. Artamonoff collection in its entirety in the context of the burgeoning archaeological activity in Turkey and the rising interest in the Byzantine heritage of Istanbul. The photographs do not only represent the state of the monuments, cityscapes and archaeological sites in 1935-1945, but they also shed light on this period of enlivened archaeological work. Thus, this paper attempts to reconstruct the *modus operandi* of the photographer by retracing his steps in Istanbul and Western Turkey in time and space.

Albumen and Silver, Stone and Earth: Photography of Byzantine Monuments and Archaeology, 1870-1940

Heather E. Grossman (University of Illinois - Chicago)

This paper assesses the photography of Byzantine monuments and archaeological sites in Greece and Turkey from roughly the 1870s through the 1930s, particularly focusing on images that were commercially available or published in this period. American and European photographers, as well as Greek and Turkish photographic firms, regularly stocked for their diverse clientele pictures of Late Antique and Byzantine sites through catalog sales, individually selected as well as ready-made albums, and photographic books devoted to Mediterranean locales. The Scotsman James Robertson (1850s-1860s), the Sébah (Sébah and Joaillier) firm (1857-1952) and the Abdullah Frères (1858-1900) in Istanbul, Greek photographers such as Petros Moraites (1859-1888), the Rhomaides Brothers (c. 1880s) and Pericles Papachatzidakis (1940s), and other foreigners such as Frédéric Boissonnas, the Swiss photographer who traveled in Greece extensively between the 1910s and 1930s, and Antoine Bon, the French researcher of medieval Greek architecture, together produced hundreds of photographs of Byzantine and Late Antique monuments and sites. Some of the photographers (Robertson, Sébah, Abdullah Frères) had affiliations with government bodies, while others had strong ties to academic entities (Papachatzidakis and Bon). However, for all of them, most photographs were produced first and foremost for public sale or publication. Many of these images can be found today in research collections throughout the world, transforming what were primarily commercial products into scholarly and fine art materials. While often of great aesthetic as well as archaeological value (for example, as records of now-altered monuments and sites), the circumstances of their creation are of equal import, in terms of photographic technologies and distribution goals as well as how they reveal contemporary cultural and scholarly values.

The paper looks at the production and dissemination of such photographs to examine how and why Byzantine architecture and archaeology – and Byzantium itself – was a commercially popular photographic subject in the later nineteenth and mid-twentieth centuries. By looking at not only photographic images but also photographic firms' catalogs, travel guides and academic sources of the period, we see that these pictures paralleled contemporary statist schemes, took part in a touristic economy and also supported and thrived off of the nascent academic field of Byzantine studies. Along with changes in camera technologies in the seventy years under consideration, changes in photographic framing and intellectual approaches towards Byzantine monuments can be seen in the photography of local and international photographers alike.

What Were They Looking for? What Did They See? Interpreting the Aims of Early Photographers of Byzantium

Matthew Savage (Louisiana State University)

With the systematic digitization and increased accessibility of photographic archives around the world, old photographs will play an ever greater role in the interpretation of the physical evidence of culture that includes architecture, monumental decoration, and archaeological sites. Old photographs are particularly relevant for the study of Byzantium. Since the first photographs of Byzantine material remains appeared in the nineteenth century, many significant monuments have vanished, often leaving the early photographic records as the only method of accessing them. In particular, the dramatic development of urban environments, such as Istanbul and Thessaloniki, over the course of the twentieth century has resulted in the loss or significant alteration of major monuments that today can only be understood by consulting old photographs.

While art historians know the value of old photographs for studying Byzantine material, the photographers themselves (with few exceptions) have remained in the background. It is, however, legitimate and even essential to ask who these photographers were, and what their intentions were in photographing what they did. Archaeologists and persons interested in historic material will have different focal points for their camera lenses than those travelling for leisure. But even scholars' aims will vary, and, for monuments, different interests can have striking results. For instance, a scholar interested in vault construction will photograph a building in a

different manner than a scholar whose focus is wall painting or floor mosaics. Information is filtered not only through the photographer's lens, but also through his decision – conscious or not – what to document and what to leave out.

Particularly for lost or altered monuments, our reliance on a group of photographs affects our understanding of the monuments and can even influence our interpretation of their significance today. The increase in digitization of photographs, the development of more sophisticated indexing tools, and the implementation of open-access policies at many archives today facilitate the study of not just the monuments that were documented, but also the photographs themselves and the people making them. Finally, knowledge of individual photographers' motives in conducting photographic campaigns provides us with invaluable evidence of changing interests in and methods of art historical research from the nineteenth century to today. This paper goes behind the camera and examines the aims of several early photographers, including Arthur Kingsley Porter and Nicholas V. Artamonoff, in looking at and in documenting Byzantine monuments. It also reflects on some of the repercussions their viewpoints have had on the interpretation and understanding of the material documented.

Session VIIIB: Sixth Century West

Chair: Leslie Dossey (Loyola University Chicago)

Bishops and Exarchs: A Reexamination of the Early Exarchates in the *Registrum* of Gregory I

Hannah Ewing (The Ohio State University)

There has been little modern scholarship focused on the early exarchate in Byzantine Italy. Since the nineteenth-century writings of Charles Diehl and Ludo Hartmann, the first several decades of the exarch office has only received attention in some half-dozen books and articles. In the limited scholarship addressing the sixth- and early seventh-century exarchs, scholars including Diehl, Hartmann, Louis Bréhier, George Ostrogorsky, A.H.M. Jones, and T.S. Brown have celebrated these officials' emergence in Italy and North Africa as an important administrative reform meant to stabilize and better govern the western provinces during the various invasions of Italy and North Africa in the late sixth century. This, however, is an oversimplification when applied to the initial decades of the exarchates and does not fit with the picture that emerges on the ground in Italy. After all, the new exarchs did not step into an administrative vacuum: numerous other prelates were already present in the West, not least among them bishops. As such, and moreover given the significance of the bishop-exarch relationship in the later exarchates (*n.b.* André Guillou and T.S. Brown), the scholarly narrative of the early exarchs' importance and effectiveness needs reevaluation. It needs to take the exarchs' prelate colleagues the bishops into better consideration – especially as much of the extant evidence on the exarchs comes from episcopal sources and is dependent on that exarch-bishop relationship.

Part of the lack of scholarly attention to the earliest decades of the exarchates stems from a relative dearth of source material. The evidence is largely silent on the regional administrative situation in Italy between Justinian's conquests in the 540s/550s and the letters of Gregory I, bishop of Rome (590-604), and the bulk of what evidence there is was written well after this period. This makes Gregory's *Registrum* of episcopal letters all the more important for understanding the position and authority of the exarchs in this early period. An examination of these letters reveals that, due to the novelty of the exarch office, the established administrative expectations of the bishops already present in the West, and the ultimately conflicting priorities of the two administrations, Italy ca. 600 was in a state of disorganized administrative transformation. Whatever the later authority of the exarchs, the transition of regional civic power from local prelates and bishops to the exarchs was not smooth, especially in the period of

Gregory I's episcopate. In the end, Gregory's letters reveal that the exarchs' power and influence in this initial period must be considered more cautiously than they have been in prior scholarship.

"Waiting Only for a Pretext:" A New Chronology for the Sixth-Century Byzantine Invasion of Spain

Jason Fossella (Saint Louis University)

In the mid-sixth century, the Emperor Justinian sent an army to Spain, under the pretense of intervening in a dynastic dispute among the Visigoths. This expedition ended in the acquisition of territory for the Empire in the southern part of the Iberian peninsula. Referred to as the province of Spania, this region would remain in Byzantine hands until the 620s. This paper argues that the common modern version of the invasion, in which Byzantine forces arrived in 552, fought on the side of the usurper Athanagild until 555, and then fought against Athanagild for a brief period before concluding a treaty with him, is flawed. Relying on a more precise reading of the sources, it proposes a new chronology and narrative, in which Byzantine forces did not arrive until 554. In this version, Justinian's invasion of Spain appears even more predatory than his invasions of North Africa or Italy, and the reason for the relatively small extent of the Byzantine conquests in Spain becomes clear.

Procopius and Merovingian History: the Use of Eastern Histories for Dating the Early Sixth Century in Merovingian Frankia

Laurent J. Cases (The Pennsylvania State University)

Generally speaking, the decades from the death of Clovis in AD 518 until the death of Chlothar I in AD 555 are complicated in terms of dating. Indeed, the chronology of Gregory of Tours, the sole source for the period, has been widely discredited by scholars. Ian Wood and Danuta Shanzer are at the forefront of this criticism. Using letters from Avitus of Vienne and bishop Rhemigius, they have proven that Clovis may have been baptized as early as AD 496, instead of the proposed AD 508 in Gregory. Furthermore, the influential work of Walter Goffart, *The Narrators of Barbarian History*, has shown that one must be carefully aware of Gregory's histories, as he often twists personal goals to fit his agenda. The main conclusion one can draw from this strand of scholarship is that, when using Gregory for information prior to his own tenure as bishop of Tours in AD 567, one should use one or multiple independently transmitted documents.

If the early sixth century possesses a wealth of alternate sources, the period between the death of Avitus of Vienne in AD 523 and AD 567 is surprisingly poor. Leaving Gregory aside, Venantius Fortunatus is our main independent source for the events after AD 555. That leaves the period of the first partition between AD 518 and AD 555 muddled by the account of Gregory. The general discussions of that time in modern scholarship reflect this lack of sources, indeed few monographs attempt to reconstruct the time period between AD 518 and AD 555, and, when they do, most rely on the chronology of Eugen Ewig, which itself is largely based on Gregory of Tours.

Taking this chronology of Eugen Ewig as a starting point this paper investigates ways to refine the chronology. More specifically, one source is generally overlooked: Procopius of Caesarea. If Procopius is not overly concerned with Merovingian Frankia, he does provide a framework, a more certain chronology. How can Procopius's *Wars* help the historian of the Merovingians? To what extent are Byzantine sources reliable? This paper demonstrates that Procopius can, and should be used, as a supplement for Gregory of Tours' *Ten Books of Histories* for the period between AD 511 and AD 555.

Session VIIIC: Byzantine Historiography of the Twelfth Century

Chair: Dimitris Krallis (Simon Fraser University)

Religion and Gender in the *Alexiad:* The Case of Anna Dalassene

Marin Cerchez (University of Wisconsin – Madison)

The colorful description of Anna Dalassene's religiosity in Anna Komnene's *Alexiad* has been taken as a faithful reflection of her deep piety. In this study I argue that the portrayal of Anna Dalassene as an extremely heavenly-minded and pious nun was conditioned by the need to respond to twelfth-century ideas of proper gender. Anna Komnene deployed both Christian and classical themes to exonerate her grandmother and father from charges of mishandling of gender roles and inappropriate behavior. Depicting Dalassene as a nun was one part of this strategy.

Anna Dalassene's co-ruling with her son for about twenty years challenged two areas of cultural assumptions in Byzantium: first, the ideas about women in power, and second, the ideas about motherhood and male adulthood. Women in power, such as Dalassene, were open to criticism for incompetence in administration and lust for power. Another set of gender-related criticisms relates to Dalassene's unusually extended motherly tutelage over Alexios and his immaturity and dependence on his mother. Roman mothers had an important role in the education and formation of their sons. However the effort of sons to break away from maternal tutelage was considered appropriate. When considered against a background of classical construction of imperial motherhood, the ongoing interfering of Alexios's mother in his affairs once he had reached adulthood challenged his male adulthood.

Anna Komnene, desiring to portray Dalassene and Alexios positively, responded to the lack of correspondence between Dalassene and Alexios and standard ideals of behavior by constructing a complex narrative deploying classical and Christian ideals. Anna blends classical and Christian imagery in the *Alexiad*, making it difficult to divide clearly her models and ideals into distinct religious categories.

Anna Komnene uses the template of a *basilikos logos,* where Alexios and Dalassene together form one body of the ruler, to structure her narrative. A number of other sets of Christian images, allusions and associations deal with different aspects of the gender discrepancies mentioned above. Komnene compares Dalassene to the mother of God as another way to justify Dalassene's power and Alexios's dependence on his mother. Moreover, to refute lust-for-power criticisms Anna Komnene introduces Dalassene's depiction as devout nun and a spiritual counselor to

Alexios, and uses Roman and Christian ideas about mother-son relationship, where the mother takes care of her family and her son is obedient and respectful.

These strategies help Anna Komnene counter criticisms directed against her father and her grandmother and create a positive image of both Dalessene and Alexios. This also means that the intense use of religious images and rhetoric in relation to Anna Dalassene in the *Alexiad* should not be taken at face value because it is conditioned by the problems connected with gender-related cultural assumptions about women in power, motherhood and male adulthood.

Singing Threnodies while Writing History: Gender and Grieving in the Anna Komnene's *Alexiad*

Leonora Neville (University of Wisconsin-Madison)

Some readers who have not delighted in Anna Komnene's *Alexiad* object to a perceived artificiality, in particular taking Anna's out-bursts of grief at the memory of lost loved-ones as emotionally false. Anna brings her lamentation to the center of the action when she weeps over the death of her husband Nikephoros Bryennios, her betrothed Constantine Doukas, and her father. Readers have doubted whether Anna's grief was still so intense, so long after their natural deaths, and in Constantine's case, whether she had ever grieved so deeply.

Anna's expressions of grieving are distrusted and perceived as disturbing, in part because they are jarring departures from the traditions of Greek history writing. Thucydides and Xenophon's manner of 'objectively' writing about their own actions in a detached third-person established a tradition of emotional distance between the writer of history and his subject. Authors such as Polybios may appear in their histories to comment on the direction of the argument; they even may indicate their opinions regarding the course of events and the lessons to be drawn from history, but they do not emote, let alone weep. Readers who have internalized the standards of practice of the Greek historiographical tradition would naturally feel a sense of disjuncture or impropriety at Anna's outbursts of grieving.

Anna understood the standards and 'rules' of the Greek historiographical tradition as well as anyone else. When she transgressed those rules, we can be sure she knew what she was doing.

She says as much when, after beginning to cry over the death of Constantine Doukas, she pulls herself back "lest by mingling my own lamentations with the historical narrative, I may confuse the history" (1.12.). Anna here calls attention to the impropriety of a historian openly mourning while she does just that.

Anna was also doubtless aware that all the histories she had were written by men. In choosing to write history, Anna was venturing to speak within a discourse that had always been male. Anna presumably knew of a different discourse, also with a tradition reaching back into deep antiquity, in which women's voices predominated: lamentation for the dead. Wailing women giving vent to grief through ritualized gestures of irrationality constitute one of the most continuous tropes in Mediterranean culture. The suggestion made here is that Anna was aware of her rarity as a woman writer and responded to the transgression of her own behavior by presenting herself as also doing what good women do, which is to mourn.

Anna's outpourings of grief may help her negotiate the fundamental transgression of writing history as a woman. In lamenting the dead, Anna was performing one of the key valorized roles for Greek women. Anna wrote about herself crying, in a manner she understood as disruptive to standards of historiography, so she could play both female and male roles, and perhaps in acknowledgement that a history written by a woman would not adhere completely to those standards.

Niketas Choniates' Proteus: Rethinking the Paradoxical "Roles" of Andronikos I

Christen Rene Chaffins (University of Wisconsin - Madison)

Niketas Choniates prefaces his history of the Byzantine court from 1118 to 1207 CE by promising the reader an "unadorned," "natural," and "unambiguous" text. What follows is a direct contradiction of the preface, prompting the reader to be alert for complexity, paradox, and rhetorical devices employed by the author. For this paper, I chose to focus specifically on Andronikos I as an example of this literary reversal.

Scholarly attention to Choniates' characterization of Andronikos I has so far focused on the emperor's role as an Odyssean figure (e.g., Efthymiadis, 2009; Saxey, 2009), however several issues complicate this theory. First, Choniates' many characterizations of Andronikos create a paradox which is not Odyssean: he is at times masculine, feminine, sometimes Odysseus, often Polyphemus, governed by Ares, or governed by Eros. Furthermore, a large section of the text focuses on Andronikos' failed attempts to escape and his extended periods in captivity. The attention placed on the escape-captivity cycle does not exhibit any parallelism with the *Odyssey*. Like Proteus, Andronikos' escapes only occur when his hands are free, and his captivity is only maintained when he is fettered. Odysseus is never placed under any similar physical restraints of captivity, and is certainly not captured in the same manner as Andronikos. These roles and scenarios can only be understood by recognizing the tyrant as a Proteus (i.e., fickle and ever-changing). This, I argue, is the main paradox within the text: Andronikos simultaneously fits all of these contradictory roles, and none of them.

By analyzing the intertextuality of the *Annals,* the characterization of Andronikos as Proteus gains more validity. Examining the use of protean imagery in other writers, particularly Eustathios of Thessaloniki, can deepen our understanding of Choniates' portrayal. Regardless of whether Choniates studied directly under Eustathios, there is no doubt that the former took inspiration from and heavily referenced the latter. In his *On the Capture of Thessalonica*, for example, Eustathios describes Andronikos as a Proteus. I argue that this specific characterization led Choniates to envision the tyrant similarly, and to extend the metaphor further. Many of the epithets usually attributed to Odysseus gain new meanings when Eustathios and other writers of Antiquity are considered. For instance, many works subsequent to Homer contain references to the 'Old Man of the Sea.' The description and epithets for Proteus are usually reminiscent to those of Homer's Odysseus. It is plausible that the protean characterization within Nonnus, Ovid,

Philostratus and Vergil would have influenced Eustathios and Choniates when constructing Andronikos as a Proteus. This paper explores the ways in which these intermediary writers—from the second century CE up through Eustathios—may have affected Choniates' understanding of the Homeric Proteus and his depiction of Andronikos.

Session IXA: Panel in Honor of Walter Kaegi (III)

Chair: Daniel Larison (Elmhurst College)

A Christian philosophy of warfare?
Internal evidence for the shape and purpose of the *Taktika* of Leo VI

Meredith L.D. Riedel (University of Oxford)

When Leo VI (r.886-912) composed the *Taktika*, he did not intend to create a military manual that would be merely an homage to the emperor Maurice (r. 582-602) and his well-known *Strategikon*. Rather, he intended it to be intensely practical; indeed, its precepts were embraced and expanded by the generals of the tenth-century reconquest. Leo states repeatedly that he was spurred to write the book because of the Saracen threat, and the apparently unsatisfactory Byzantine defence, yet he does not offer much in terms of new tactics to counter a new enemy. Previous analyses of the *Taktika* have been limited to discrete aspects of this vast work, primarily to Leo's expositions on strategy, either in the realm of naval tactics [Pryor and Jeffreys on Constitution XIX in *The age of the dromon: the Byzantine navy ca. 500-1204* (Leiden, 2006)] or recruitment policies (Dagron on Constitution XVIII in 'Byzance et le modèle islamique au Xe siècle à propos des *Constitutions Tactiques* de l'empereur Leon VI', *CRAI* (1983), 219-242). The argument offered here seeks to expand the horizon of thought by examining the book and Leo's deeper purposes for it, as a whole.

Why did Leo VI, a bookish, non-campaigning emperor, write a military manual? In the text itself he claims several purposes: to improve Roman tactics in the face of an aggressive enemy (XVIII.1-15, 139-154), to educate Byzantine generals on military science (XX.1), and to bolster morale (Epilogue 21). Although his manual discusses strategy, tactics, received wisdom from earlier eras, and the problem of Saracen military success, Leo's primary interest and expertise is manifestly not in those things. For him, Byzantine military success finds its true foundation in Christian theology and the advantages that accrue to those who believe in the Orthodox Christian God. Compiling and annotating previous military manuals provided the vehicle for him to set out a distinctly Byzantine philosophy of warfare. Above all, Leo was a pious emperor who wanted to expound principles for pursuing warfare with the aid of Orthodox Christian faith.

The Prologue, the Epilogue, and Constitution XVIII together present Leo's immediate concern (the Saracen threat), his chief interest (theology), and the key to his proposed solution (the piety of the general). The Epilogue represents the 'crib notes' for this vast work, identifying its foundational principles, key thoughts, and recommended trajectory and focuses on what is unique to Byzantine leadership.

This paper traces these connections so that the larger picture emerges, revealing not only Leo's underlying purpose, but a clearer understanding of the message of the *Taktika* as a whole. At the very heart of this subtle argument, he is seeking to craft a Byzantine cultural identity that finds its greatest prosperity in renewed and characteristic Christian piety.

The Meditations of Kekavmenos: The *Strategikon* as Spiritual Exercise

Leonidas Pittos (Wayne State University)

G.G. Litavrin's edition of the *Strategikon* of Kekavmenos concludes with a counsel for vigilance: "For our Lord and God says in the divine gospels to be vigilant at all times. 'If the master of the house had known what hour the thief would come, he would have watched and not allowed his house to be broken into.'" Kekavmenos continued by pointing out that, whereas the dominical exhortation to be vigilant was in reference to spiritual things, it was to be applied to earthly (*biōtikas*) matters as well. He qualified his point with the evocation of a practical, martial concern: the possibility of enemy raid. Yet the watchfulness he insisted as necessary for the *stratēgos* suggested more than just a vigilance against the untimely incursions of barbarian (or civilized) belligerents. Rather, it was an inner discipline that informed a general's exercise of authority and his fulfillment of obligations to himself, his family, soldiers, populace, senior commanders, emperor and, ultimately, his God. Kekavmenos explicitly linked the discipline of watchfulness to spiritual exercise, comparable to the monastic disciplines of *nēpsis* and *phylakē*. This paper is an exploration of the inner life of a Byzantine general and his advice and admonitions to his sons. The *Strategikon*, belonging to the genre of gnomic literature, is rooted within a tradition of meditative instruction, akin to the ascetic handbooks of the monks. Kekavmenos' *Strategikon* is a meditation in the form of an exhortation on the inner discipline of the *stratēgos*, intended to shape a habit of mind. A close reading of Kekavmenos demonstrates that the literary form of *gnōmē* and *chreia* form the core of most chapters of the *Strategikon*, with each chapter representing an elaboration on the specific moral lesson succinctly summarized in its gnomic core. The *gnōmē* (maxim), the succinct articulation of a general truth intended to exhort or dissuade, and the *chreia*, the recollection of a saying or deed of a particular person with a pointed meaning, according to the *Progymnasmata* of Hermogenes, represented indispensible tools of instruction, particularly relevant to ethical, philosophical, and spiritual formation throughout the Byzantine era. More than just compilations of ancient quotations, *gnōmika*

presented the Byzantine reader with source material for continual contemplation—quite literally "food for thought". Readers were called to memorize gnomic statements and repeat them, penetrating their psyche in order to reorder the soul in imitation of the moral lesson. In touching upon the moral and mental discipline of the general, Kekavmenos' *Strategikon* elucidates the cultural and even cognitive dimensions of the art of strategy in Byzantium. While it is unique in many ways and original, the *Strategikon's* gnomic, meditative nature suggests that Byzantine military manuals may be read as more than just sources on tactics, but as a gnomic genre aimed at the formation of a habit of mind.

Constans II's Speech to the Senate: An Enquiry into an Odd Event

David Olster (University of Kentucky)

Scholarship is greatly indebted to Walter Kaegi for his elucidation of the chronology and causes of the success of the Arab invasions and the limited, and ultimately ineffectual, response of the Byzantines, particularly after their defeat at Yarmuk. He has particularly drawn attention to the critical role played by the political instability following Heraclius's death when court factions formed around his sons Heraclonas and Constantine III, and then after the death of the latter, his son, Heraclius's grandson, Constans II. These complicated shifts of power from Constantine to Heraclonas (and his mother Martina) and then to Constans II (and his military patron Valentinus, whose daughter he married), significantly hindered Byzantine efforts to defend Alexandria and recover Egypt at a critical moment. The object of this paper is to consider an odd event that occurred during this confused time: a (very) short speech that the young Constans II delivered to the Senate after the overthrow of his uncle and step-grandmother. In this speech he thanks the Senate for their decision to set him in his uncle's place and restore "lawful" rule to the Empire, asks for their future counsel and bestows gifts upon the Senators.

This speech is odd in several respects. First, its preservation itself is peculiar. It is recorded in Theophanes's *Chronicle* under the year 641/42 and other than the judicial proceedings against Pope Martin and Maximus the Confessor, is the most detailed entry about imperial ceremony during his reign, about which we otherwise know virtually nothing. It is also the only official imperial voice that we have preserved from the end of Heraclius's reign to the correspondence surrounding the Sixth Ecumenical Council beginning in the late 670s. What this source was and

how Theophanes came to preserve it is a *quellenkritik* problem that must first be addressed in order to determine the potential literary context and value of this annalistic entry.

Beyond the basic problem of identifying Theophanes's source, the political context of the speech is unclear. Constans II, so far as we know, was raised to power by a military coup. Why then would the court publish a speech to the Senate, an institution that had little if any political power since the sixth century (or even before)? Indeed, what was the Senate in the seventh century that an emperor would open his reign with a speech to it?

In order to answer these questions, it is necessary to bring together a variety of disparate sources including the *Book of Ceremonies*, chronicles and histories, later seventh-century imperial correspondence and earlier Heraclian sources. A review of the Senate's role in imperial ceremony in the seventh century might reveal something about the manner in which emperors employed institutional and rhetorical fictions to legitimate themselves in a period of considerable political instability.

Session IXB: Church Politics in the Fifth and Sixth Centuries

Chair: Theresa Shawcross (Amherst College)

The Minutes Will Reveal the Truth: A Rhetorical Analysis of Sources of Authority at the Council of Chalcedon

Timothy LaBarbera (University of Alabama)

In the traditional scholarly interpretation of the Council of Chalcedon (451 CE) the primary purpose of the council was to enforce unanimity on the Christological questions raised by the controversy over Eutyches. While it seems natural to assume that a discussion of Christology would dominate the council, a rhetorical analysis of the acts of the council shows that Christology was frequently not the issue being directly discussed. This paper broadens our understanding of the inner workings of the council's attempts at consensus. In fact, very little technical Christological argumentation occurs at all during the pivotal first session. Discussion was primarily carried out through appeals to sources of authority and references to arguments that had already been made prior to the council.

This paper argues that the rhetoric used in the decisive first session of the Council of Chalcedon provides a broader window into what the various parties hoped to achieve in the discussion. This study uses rhetorical analysis to classify the majority of the appeals to sources of authority into four broad categories: proper procedure, imperial authority, precedent, and the authority of Cyril of Alexandria. Tracking these sources of authority reveals that certain groups and individuals showed definite predilections toward particular sources of authority. For example, in the first session, current or one-time partisans of Dioscorus made approximately 95% of the appeals to the authority of Cyril. Despite switching sides, the bishops tended to take their favorite sources of authority with them. Rhetorical analysis can also be used to highlight shifts in the strategy used by the bishops at the council. At the beginning of the council, Dioscorus primarily defended himself with appeals to the imperial mandate he possessed at Ephesus II, however as the council turned against him, he resorted increasingly to procedural appeals. The argumentation in the first session of the Council of Chalcedon clearly reveals that the participants expected the council to function not as a forum for Christological debate but as a means of expressing ecclesiastical unanimity.

Pelagius I (556-561) and Post-Gothic War Italy

Kristina Sessa (The Ohio State University)

Pelagius I (556-561) became bishop of Rome just two years after the end of the Gothic War (535-554). By all accounts, Justinian's twenty-year campaign to reclaim the Italian peninsula from its Ostrogothic rulers and to reintegrate it into the Roman Empire was a mixed success. In a narrow political sense, the emperor achieved his goals since the barbarian kingdom was overthrown and Roman civil and military authorities returned to govern the peninsula. However, the material and human costs of the war were enormous. Thousands of Romans and Goths were killed from war and disease (the plague had hit the region in 541-2); infrastructure was destroyed; major cities such as Rome, Naples and Milan fell under siege and some were subsequently depopulated; agricultural land was expropriated or even destroyed and villas vanished; bishoprics disappeared and martyr shrines were desecrated. In short, Justinian's efforts to re-conquer Italy had disastrous effects on late Roman Italian society, its economy, its cultural institutions and its religious life. This was the Italy that Pelagius encountered when he was selected in 556 to lead the Roman church.

While many scholars are aware of the devastation that the Gothic War wrought on the Italian peninsula, few have studied its immediate impact on the level of the individual or even individual institutions. The correspondence of Pelagius is an extraordinary and understudied body of evidence on how lay elites and non-elites, clerics, monks and imperial officials experienced the chaos and instability of post-Gothic war Italy. In my paper, I shall discuss a number of Pelagius' letters, which present the bishop responding to a wide range of emergencies related to the quotidian and spiritual life of Italians, from identity theft and stolen church property to neglected estates, clergy-less churches, doctrinal disputes and fugitive slaves. I shall argue that these crises – many of which were direct casualties of the war – provided Pelagius with opportunities to develop a reputation for "troubleshooting" precisely at a moment when troubles hit every level of society. Thus in addition to offering a more textured picture of post-Gothic war Italy, my paper explores how the war impacted upon the Roman bishop's ecclesiastical status in the region and, more specifically, how it affected his relationship to civil and military authorities at this critical moment in the Byzantine (and papal) history of Italy. In conclusion, it shall also consider how, and to what extent, Pelagius' letters offer insight into the impact of Justinian's Pragmatic Sanction on the level of individuals and everyday life.

Evagrius Scholasticus: The Emperor and the Ecclesiae

David A. Heayn (The Graduate Center, City University of New York)

Evagrius of Epiphania (c.535 - c.595), was the author of a late sixth century ecclesiastical history (*Historia Ecclesiae*) spanning the reign of the emperor Theodosius II to the 12th year of the emperor Maurice. He avowedly takes up the historiographical task from his fifth century predecessors, Socrates Scholasticus and Sozomen placing himself within the larger tradition. The genre of the *Historia Ecclesiae* stretches back into the early fourth century, with the first crystallized formulation by Eusebius of Caesarea. Evagrius' *HE* is one of the last extant examples of the genre and both modern historiography and he himself places his work within this tradition. Unfortunately, within the modern historiographical tradition, this aspect has overshadowed the value of the *HE* itself. Evagrius is described, almost exclusively, as merely a continuator of the earlier historiographical tradition who contributed nothing original to the established formula/genre. However, the changing landscape of the sixth century eastern Roman Empire in its literary, political, and religious spheres presented Evagrius with a very different world than his predecessors. An elaboration of the events and changes of the sixth century are not however the focus of this paper. Evagrius' *HE* and the perspective he provides on the reception of these events is the central concern. This paper argues that the writings of Evagrius should not be seen simply as an extension of earlier works. Rather, one should see Evagrius' *HE* as representative of a sixth century reconceptualization of the *Historia Ecclesiae*. In this paper, Evagrius then embodies a perspective that reflects the fears and concerns of his own contemporary milieu while utilizing existing forms and adapting them to new purposes.

The historiographical question to be answered in this paper is then to what extent Evagrius represents a separate, distinctly sixth century version of the *Historia Ecclesiae*. The view of Evagrius as little more than a continuator of the earlier tradition of Eusebius, inherited through the fifth century ecclesiastical historians, has been at best myopic. The sixth century was not the same world in which Eusebius wrote, and the differences had a significant influence on the form and analysis of the *HE*. This paper further argues that Evagrius' emphasis on the eirenic nature of proper imperial rule can be seen in the way in which he articulates Church-State relations. By defining both the emperor and the ecclesiae as most relevant within an intimate relation with one another Evagrius pursues his eirenic ideal through concepts of piety, harmony, and the imitation of the Divine in the form of a providential *speculum princeps*. Evagrius' place within the *HE* tradition, and the misunderstanding of his work, has received very little necessary scholarly

attention. With the exception of the work done by Michael Whitby and Pauline Allen very few grasp the importance of Evagrius and the sixth century. More broadly, scholarship has begun to address issues regarding the nature of Roman/Christian kingship throughout the last two decades and this research continues within that burgeoning historical tradition.

Session XA: Sinai and Syria

Chair: Derek Krueger (University of North Carolina – Greensboro)

"Face to Face without Shadow": Visual Culture at Sinai in the 13th Century

Kristine Larison (University of Chicago)

Noted by Kurt Weitzmann and richly explored in subsequent scholarship, the collection of icons at the Monastery of Saint Catherine on Mount Sinai provides an important sampling of Crusader art. Most intriguing are the number of panels representing site-specific subject matter. Images of Moses, the Virgin of the Bush, and Saint Catherine belong to a much larger body of Sinaitic saints associated with the monastery in this period. However, these three become significant patrons in their own right. They are shown together in a 13th-century icon juxtaposing Saint Catherine with a literal illustration of the Virgin in the Burning Bush. Moses appears on either side of this typological vision, although depicted on a smaller scale than the other figures. His posture echoes the monumental scene of Moses before the Burning Bush in the 6th-century mosaic decoration of the monastery church and clearly draws upon an established pictorial tradition at Sinai. What has proved trickier to parse is the relationship between Saint Catherine, whose relic cult was just taking off, and the Virgin of the Bush, for whom a new iconography was being innovated in the early 13th century.

This paper considers two documents that have been used as evidence for the introduction of Saint Catherine's relics within the monastery church at Sinai. One is the liturgical typikon drawn up by Abbot Symeon in 1214. The other is a pilgrimage account by Magister Thietmar, who visited the Holy Land in 1217. Nancy Patterson Ševčenko and Anastasia Drandaki have both drawn on these textual sources, along with the testimony of other pilgrims, to elucidate the early cult of Saint Catherine and its impact on visual culture at the Sinai monastery. I believe more can be said, in particular, with regards to the contrast between large-scale panel painting that reproduces monumental imagery of Saint Catherine (likewise, of Moses) and the usually small-scale, devotional icons with the Virgin of the Bush. Rather than attributing the new Marian type to a missing cult image, the Virgin *tou Vatou* was meant to evoke the kind of theophanic experience modeled by the Old Testament prophet. Moses' request to see the face of God was only fulfilled when he stood with Christ on Mount Tabor. The Incarnation provided the same access for every individual. It was this doctrine that the iconography conflating Virgin and Child with the vision of the Burning Bush celebrated. Its theological impetus may explain why several competing pictorial types seem to have co-existed, yet each maintained the specificity of a *locus sanctus* image. The possibility of achieving inner vision is critical to Byzantine icon theory but rarely demonstrated through pictorial analysis. With the Virgin of the Bush at Sinai, we find a

series of images that explicitly refer, not to a monumental prototype, but to visionary experience instead.

Expressions of Faith and Donation: The Sinai Apse Mosaic Inscription and its Levantine Counterparts

Sean Leatherbury (Corpus Christi College, University of Oxford)

The apse and triumphal arch mosaic of the Church of the Monastery of Saint Catherine at Mount Sinai, with its magnificent depictions of the Transfiguration of Christ, apostles, saints, donors and scenes of Moses, has been studied in terms of iconography, style and potential meanings, notably by Kurt Weitzmann in the 1950s and 60s, culminating in his publication with George H. Forsyth of *The Monastery of Saint Catherine at Mount Sinai: Volume One, The Church and Fortress of Justinian*. More recently, Jaś Elsner and Robert Nelson have discussed the mosaic as an aid to the contemplation of the divine, viewed by the faithful amidst the flickering light from the candles which must have filled the space in late antiquity, as they do today. However, scholars have consistently noted the disconnect between the mosaic image and its contemporaneous inscription, running immediately below the scene of the Transfiguration: the image is rich in exegetic and symbolic overtones, while the inscription is at first glance a standardized dedication text, naming some (though not all) of the church's donors, articulating their motivation for donation (*soteria,* salvation) and dating the mosaic by indiction year. The Sinai inscription is thus significantly different from almost all other known mosaic or carved inscriptions from the apses and walls of early Christian churches, which are written in relatively high-register Greek (for example, Anicia Juliana's inscription in Hagios Polyeuktos) or Latin (for example, the mosaic inscriptions in Santi Cosma e Damiano in Rome or the Basilica Eufrasiana in Poreč/Parenzo) and incorporate biblical passages, narratives of the construction of the church or *ekphraseis* of the mosaic image with which the inscription is paired.

This paper re-examines the Sinai apse inscription in terms of its regional context in the Late Antique East, an analysis only made possible through my collation of the majority of late antique church mosaic inscriptions from the Eastern Mediterranean (D.Phil. Thesis, forthcoming). I compare the specific epigraphic components of the text with similar mosaic inscriptions from the floors of late antique churches in the Levant, focusing on the initial formula ' Ἐν ὀνόματι π(ατ)ρ(ὸ)ς κ(αὶ) υ(ίο)ῦ κ(αὶ) ἁγίου πν(εύματο)ς' and related formulae used in sixth to seventh

century churches in modern-day Jordan, Syria and Israel, and placing the formula in its proper context as performed in daily liturgical rites. I then turn to the term used to describe the donors, 'καρποφορησάντ(ων)', discuss equivalent uses of the term in other Levantine church mosaic inscriptions and examine the implications of naming or not-naming all the donors in the main donation inscription; after all, though Justinian and Theodora are mentioned in inscriptions carved into the beams of the roof over the nave, they (and John the Deacon, whose portrait appears below the inscription) are not named in the apse. By comparing the Sinai mosaic inscription with near-contemporaneous mosaic inscriptions from nearby churches, this paper articulates the reason for the disconnect between inscription and image in the Sinai apse and places each significant component of the inscription in its proper Levantine context.

The Syriac Reference Portal (www.syriac.ua.edu):
A New Collaborative Resource for Byzantinists

David A. Michelson (University of Alabama)

Syriac is a dialect of Aramaic which was once spoken by populations stretching across the Middle East and Central Asia. For much of the first millennium CE, Syriac served as a dominant lingua franca used in travel, trade, and religious culture from the Eastern coast of the Mediterranean to beyond the Iranian plateau. Even after the Arabization of the Middle East, Syriac literature and networks of Syriac-speaking scholars served as a cultural bridge between the Greek world of Byzantium and the Arab courts of the Islamic states. Today, perhaps more than ten thousand manuscripts, or manuscript fragments, written in Syriac survive. These manuscripts offer historical evidence on a wide variety of subjects relevant to Byzantine studies.

The value of these Syriac sources notwithstanding, they have been largely inaccessible to non-specialists for a variety of reasons. First, many of the scholarly resources for Syriac studies are now dated by more than half a century. For example, the best comprehensive survey of Syriac literature still remains Anton Baumstark's *Geschichte der syrischen Literatur*, published in 1922. Scholars lack a convenient reference to help them locate current editions and translations of texts or reliable information about authors, texts, and secondary literature. A second and even greater challenge is that a significant portion of Syriac literature remains unpublished. Finding these sources requires navigating a complicated maze of nearly 1000 finding aids. For some important

collections of manuscripts (such as the Vatican collections), scholars must rely in part upon a catalogue published in the 1700s!

In an effort to make the field of Syriac studies more accessible to both Syriac specialists and scholars in a variety of fields (Byzantine studies, Islamic studies, Biblical studies, etc.), an international team of scholars has begun work on a new online reference guide, the Syriac Reference Portal. A joint project of Princeton University and the University of Alabama, the Syriac Reference Portal has three aims: 1) to compile and organize core data related to the study of Syriac sources; 2) to create digital tools for widely disseminating this data and facilitating further research; 3) to organize the data and tools through an online hub (cyberinfrastructure) for future research in the field of Syriac studies.

This presentation introduces the Syriac Reference Portal, demonstrates some of the features (both those already available and those in development) and seeks user feedback for future development and collaboration.

Cathedral Churches in Syrian Antioch from the Late Antique to Crusader Periods

Wendy Mayer (Australian Catholic University)

During the course of a recent reappraisal of the full range of archaeological and literary evidence concerning the churches of Syrian Antioch in the period from Constantine to the Umayyad conquest of Syria, several peculiarities concerning the identity of the cathedral church of the city in Late Antiquity and the periods of Byzantine and Frankish rule emerged. Current wisdom holds that in Late Antiquity (from 341 CE onwards) the Great Church was the cathedral church of Antioch and that it persisted in that role until at least the end of the sixth century. During Frankish occupation (1098-1268) the cathedral, assumed to be independent of the Great Church and located at an entirely different site, is identified as the Church of St. Peter. In the second decade of the sixth century, however, there emerges in the sources a Church of Cassian that also exhibits properties of a cathedral church and that continues to play a prominent role in the city up to and during the crusader period. In his chronicle, Michael the Syrian, discussing events of 845, identifies it explicitly as the city's cathedral. Arab travellers of the tenth and eleventh centuries describe it as one of the city's most prominent churches. The question we pose

here is whether there were in fact three different cathedrals in Antioch from the time of Constantine to the Mamluk conquest or whether the history of the cathedral church or churches of this city is more complex.

In a series of highly speculative arguments we propose that, regardless of name, there were in all probability only two cathedral sites in the city from the third to thirteenth centuries. The original cathedral (the Palaia or apostolic church) disappears abruptly from the sources in the late fourth century. The Church of Cassian appears *de novo* in the sources in the early sixth century. Evidence for the rebuilding of the Great Church after the earthquakes of 526/28 is, on the other hand, ambiguous. The Church of St. Peter, prominent in the sources of the Byzantine and Frankish periods is identified on occasion as 'the church of the apostles'. The history of the Habib Neccar Mosque, the most prominent in modern Antakya, situated centrally on the old Roman cardo and containing 'apostolic' remains, raises further questions. According to its history, a mosque was constructed on the site immediately after Umayyad rule began in Antioch (the late 630s), the building was converted to a church in the tenth century when the city returned to Byzantine control, was reclaimed as a mosque under the Seljuks (1085-98), became once again a church under the Franks (1098-1268), and was reclaimed as a mosque when the city was taken by the Mamluks. Significantly, the labels given its interim phases as a church are Arabized versions of the name Cassian. When we pull all of this evidence together, the possibility arises that the original cathedral (the Palaia), the Church of Cassian and the Cathedral of St. Peter are one and the same.

Session XB: Church Services

Chair: Nancy Ševčenko (Vermont)

'Having Remembered all the Saints': Liturgical Commemoration and the Cult of the Saints

James C. Skedros (Holy Cross Greek Orthodox School of Theology)

During the tenth and eleventh centuries several noteworthy attempts were made to organize and systematize the often untidy and decentralized cult of the saints. Though sporadic, episodic, and lacking systematic coordination, the efforts produced results: imperial menologia, synaxaria and, importantly, the *Synaxarion of Constantinople* reflect a desire to bring together various collections of the saints for private devotion and ecclesiastical use. Most significantly was the revolution in hagiography brought about by Symeon Metaphrastes and his compilation and rewriting of numerous lives of saints. A less well-known and less examined parallel attempt at the organization of the cult of the saints is found in the liturgical manuscripts of the same time period. Although liturgical commemoration of saints on a given saint's feast day was a mainstay of Byzantine popular and ecclesiastical tradition from the fourth century onwards, specific references to the saints, collectively or individually, are lacking in pre-iconoclastic liturgical texts of the divine office.

The systematization and regularization of the cult of the saints reflected in the menologia, synaxaria, and the work of Symeon Metaphrastes are exhibited in two important liturgical texts of the tenth and eleventh centuries. The first is the lengthy presbyteral litany, "O God save your people…" of the Orthros or Matins service and which is appointed to be read following the recitation of the 50th Psalm. The second comes from the service of the prothesis, the pre-Eucharist service for the preparation of the bread and wine for use in the celebration of the Divine Liturgy. During the prothesis several commemorative particles of bread are set aside and connected to a variety of saints. In both of these liturgical prayers—the litany from Orthros and the commemoration of the saints in the prothesis—the saints are categorized in a particular hierarchal order and their liturgical commemoration forms an integral part of the service itself. Although the order and categorization of the saints are similar in the two liturgical texts there are some important differences. Yet the overall significance of the liturgical categorization of saints is unmistakable: it reflects the Byzantine attempt at organizing and systematizing the cult of the saints as evidenced elsewhere in the centuries immediately following the end of iconoclasm. An examination of the historical context and theological content of these liturgical commemorations provides further insight into the distinctive Byzantine view of the saints and the function of the cult of the saints within the larger framework of church and society.

The Space Between Lection and "The Ears to Hear": Altering Public Readings in Byzantine Lectionary Manuscripts

Warren Langford (H. Milton Haggard Center for New Testament Textual Studies, New Orleans, LA)

The work of Ernest C. Colwell and D. W. Riddle, along with many others who undertook the challenge of lectionary studies in the 1930's with the Chicago project, provides a good beginning point for the study of the Byzantine Greek lectionary manuscripts (MSS). Numerous textual variations occur in lectionary MSS. While most alterations to the public readings were in the opening statement of the lection, for example the addition of the formula "eipen o kurioj", Colwell also noted the substitution of nouns for pronouns, the omission of conjunctions and temporal adverbs, the supplying of subjects for verbs that lack them, the transposition of subject and verb, and the addition of beginning formula or exhortation.

How scribes altered the biblical text in lectionary MSS is clear, but the motivation to change is not always so clear. In general, the changes clarified the reading of the text in public worship, but to what outcome? Was clarity the only benefit for changing a lectionary reading? To what extent did altering a lectionary reading alter the message being presented throughout the reading or increase the potential for a desired response to the lectionary?

The alterations in lectionary MSS seem to always be approached through textual criticism, specifically in order to compare lectionary and continuous text MSS. This presentation proposes a reexamination of the lectionary text from alternative critical approaches. Can reader-response criticism, speech-act theory, or other forms of modern literary criticism aid in the understanding of "why" scribes made changes to the text? Can the social-scientific approaches uncover some of the reasoning behind the "why"? Lastly, could the addition of scribal motivation enhance the critical lens created by the Chicago project? If one accepts the tenet that the question of correct reading is irrelevant in the 'performative' success, then in the reading of the lection the religious 'performative' is more important than whether the reading it the same as another MS. Focusing on the reading in social process should allow one to utilize work like Tom Driver's three general aspects of meaning or Searle's system to classify utterances to understand and classify lectionary readings and the alterations in them. (Tom Driver, *The Magic of Ritual: Our Need for Liberating Rites that Transform Our Lives and our Communities* and John Searle, *Speech-Acts: An Essay In the Philosophy of Language*)

The present study seeks to see lectionaries as individual works of literature connected to their creator's disposition. Each lectionary MS had a scribe with his/her own set of social, political, and religious influences, and each lectionary manuscript holds conscious and unconscious alterations created or perpetuated with an implied audience in the mind of the scribe. This experiment with interdisciplinary activity between modern literary criticisms and one of the oldest critical approaches, textual criticism, will present selected lectionary readings from 5 lectionary MSS spanning the duration of the Byzantine Empire. The variants within the selected readings will be examined in light of 'constative' and 'performative' qualities. It also seeks a new way of approaching lectionary MSS and the potential for new descriptions for alterations made within a lectionary, thus refining the standard method of classifying lectionary variants.

Midnight Prayer and the Ordering of the Night in the early Byzantine Period

Leslie Dossey (Loyola University Chicago)

John the Prophet, a sixth-century abbot in Gaza, explained to a follower how to divide up the long winter nights: "As for nighttime sleep, take the first two hours (as reckoned from the setting of the sun) and glorify God. Then sleep for another six hours. Then get up for vigil (*agrupnia*) and do it for the remaining four hours" (Barsanuphius and John, *Ep.* 146). When asked by the same disciple how he was supposed to know the precise length of an hour at night, John advised staying awake praying one night per season (making up the sleep during the day) and recording how many verses he could recite in the course of the night. He would then be able to judge the passage of time by the number of verses. This practice of midnight prayer, sometimes followed by renewed sleep, sometimes (as here) by continuous vigil until morning, is well attested in Greek patristic authors from the third century on. Whether as a part of the monastic night office or private lay prayer or the half-night *pannychis* on Saturdays and festivals, rising in the early AM hours to pray became an important part of Byzantine piety. Scholars have generally regarded this fracturing of the night as a Christian – in particular, monastic – innovation, part of the ascetic drive to reduce sleep in order to devote more time to prayer. A recent monograph on early modern sleep habits, however, suggests an alternative approach. A. Roger Ikirch's *At Day's Close: Night in Times Past* (2005) has argued that nighttime before the adoption of modern lighting included a period of midnight wakefulness that was spent in reflection, study,

work, - or sex. A "first sleep" from shortly after sundown until the midnight would be followed by several hours of wakefulness, and then a shorter, "second sleep." The purpose of my paper is to test this hypothesis for the late antique period – specifically the Greek Mediterranean in the fourth to sixth centuries CE. To what extent did authors consider the "midnight watch" a peculiarly Christian phenomenon as opposed to a better use for a period of wakefulness that was often employed less piously? I compare the structuring of night time in Greek medical treatises such as Oribasius, Aetius, and Stephanus of Alexandria and philosophical texts such as Marinus's *Life of Proclus* to Christian texts such as John Chrysostom, Basil of Caesarea, and Palladius.

Light in the Sanctuary

Jelena Trkulja (Princeton University)

The manipulation of natural and artificial light significantly shaped the religious experience of the faithful in medieval Byzantium. Church builders carefully considered issues of fenestration, directing beams of light into the church in order to enhance the mystical effects of illumination, to spotlight moments of ceremonial importance, to elevate mystically spaces of ritual significance, and to reveal devotional images. Although recent scholarship has raised the subject of light in the context of religious art and the construction of sacred space, most of the studies have focused predominantly on the role of artificial light, leaving the more stable and dominant natural light out of the discussion.

The church sanctuary is a critical starting point for any discussion of natural illumination. The rising sun penetrated its eastern windows and touched the altar table during the morning service; the setting sun cast its last rays through the portal during vespers to illuminate the sanctuary screen. The texts of the Eucharistic rite and the liturgy of the Hours refer to the role of light in profoundly metaphorical ways. In the consideration of text and illumination, one can see the interconnection of art and rite in its most basic setting. Windows were intentionally shaped tripartite to permit light to be divided into three parts. The visual impression of three parallel sunrays appearing in the sanctuary possessed Trinitarian meaning, conveying the presence of God in all of its three hypostases. In addition to creating an architectural frame that revealed light, the church also referred to light in a less direct manner, both in the complex use of signs

that were employed to decorate the external wall of the central apse and also in a comparable use of symbols that decorated the sanctuary interior. The apse was usually the most heavily embellished area of the façade and ornaments such as discs with the sunburst motif visually reinforced the idea that light generated in the sanctuary during the liturgy was a numinous occurrence whose awesome power and presence reverberated on the exterior. A connection between exterior and interior decoration of the apse and their iconographic programs referencing light has not been explored so far. This paper presents the evidence of how both sides of the walls of the apse were designed in unison to convey the sacredness of space and how natural light was manipulated to become an anagogical tool as well as a means for shaping the religious experience of the faithful.

Index of Speakers
(Name, Session, Page)

BYZANTINE STUDIES ASSOCIATION OF NORTH AMERICA, 2010-2011

Officers

President: Robert Ousterhout (University of Pennsylvania)

Vice President: Ann Marie Yasin (University of Southern California)

Secretary: Kathleen Maxwell (Santa Clara University)

Treasurer: Elizabeth Fisher (George Washington University)

Governing Board

To serve until the 2014 conference: Cecily Hilsdale, Kostis Kourelis, Dimitris Krallis, Derek Krueger

To serve until the 2013 conference: Elizabeth Fisher, Kathleen Maxwell, Robert Ousterhout, Claudia Rapp

To serve until the 2012 conference: Elena Boeck, Sharon Gerstel, Margaret Mullett, Nancy Ševčenko

To serve until the 2011 conference: Linda Jones Hall, Eunice Dauterman Maguire, Ida Sinkevic, Ann Marie Yasin

Thirty-Seventh Annual Byzantine Studies Conference at DePaul University

Program Committee:

- Anthony Kaldellis (Chair, Ohio State University)
- Alice Christ (University of Kentucky)
- Sharon Gerstel (UCLA)
- Kostis Kourelis (Franklin & Marshall College)
- Ralph Mathisen (University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign)
- Stratis Papaioannou (Brown University)

Local Arrangements Committee:

- Elena Boeck (Chair, DePaul University)
- Walter Kaegi, (University of Chicago)
- Brian Boeck (DePaul University)
- Christina Nielsen (Art Institute of Chicago)
- Heather Grossman (University of Illinois, Chicago)